

ANNEX XV (2020-2022):
ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS



DRAFT MINUTES OF THE 89TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

Date: Wednesday, March 1, 2023 (10:00 - 12.00 CET)
 Venue: Online.
 Contacts: Kari Espegren, (kari.esepgren@ife.no), Brian Ó Gallachóir (b.ogallachoir@ucc.ie),
 George Giannakidis (ggiannakidis.gg@gmail.com)

Table 1: Participants

N.	Country	Participant	Delegate	Attended	Stand-ins
1	Australia	CSIRO	Mr. Luke REEDMAN	Yes	
2	Belgium	VITO/SPW/Brussels	Mr. Frank Meinke-Hubeny	No	
3	Denmark	ENS	Mr. Kristoffer Steen Andersen	Yes	
4	Finland	VTT/Business Finland	Jussi Mäkelä	Yes	Tiina Koljonen, Vice Chair
5	France	ADEME/EDMP/ DGEMPEDAD	Mr. Emmanuel Combet Ms Nadia Maisi	Yes	Sandrine Selosse
6	Germany	IER	Mr. Markus BLESL, Vice chair	Yes	
7	Greece	CRES	Mr. Philip Siakkis	No	
8	Italy	ENEA	Ms. Maria Gaeta	No	
9	Ireland	SEAI	Mr. Brian Ó GALLACHÓIR, Chair	Yes	
10	Japan	IEEJ	Mr. Yuhji MATSUO	Yes	
11	Kazakhstan	NURIS		No	
12	Korea	KEA	Ms. Chang Seung-chan	Yes	Ms Jumi Park
13	Netherlands	TNO	Mr. Bob van der ZWAAN	No	
14	New Zealand	EECA	Mr. Vincent Smart	Yes	
15	Norway	IFE	Ms. Kari Aamodt ESPEGREN	Yes	
16	Russia			-	
17	Spain	CIEMAT	Ms. Yolanda Lechón	Yes	
18	Sweden	STEM	Ms. Josefin THORESSON	Yes	Erik Sandberg
19	Switzerland	PSI	Ms. Anne-Kathrin FAUST	Yes	Tom Kober
20	UK	BEIS	Mr. Barry-Jon de Souza	Yes	
21	US	DOE	Mr. Sauleh A. Siddiqui	No	
22	Sponsor	ENEL Foundation	Mr. Carlo PAPA	No	

OFFICERS AND GUESTS

Antti Lehtila	VTT, Finland	Aloisius Rabata Purnama	A-Star, Singapore
Pernille Seljom	IFE, Norway	Pádraig Daly	SEAI, Ireland
Olexandr Balyk	Columbia Univ., USA	Kenneth Karlsson	Denmark
Christoph Jessen	FZJ, Germany	Paul Dodds	UCL, UK
Anna Krook-Riekkola	Lulea Univ., Sweden	George Giannakidis	ETSAP Project Head

89TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

AGENDA

No.	ITEM	DOCS
1	QUORUM COUNT	
2	ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA	
3	MINUTES OF THE 88TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE	W1
	3.1 <i>Final Minutes of the 88th Executive Committee</i>	
	3.2 <i>Matters arising</i>	
4	IEA-ETSAP IMPLEMENTING AGREEMENT	
	4.1 <i>Communication from the Secretariat</i>	W2
	4.2 <i>ETSAP Participation and Outreach activities</i>	
5	ANNEX XV (2020-2022): ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS	
	5.1 <i>Economy 2022</i>	W3
6	ANNEX XVI (2023-2025): ALIGNING ENERGY SECURITY WITH ZERO EMISSIONS ENERGY SYSTEMS	
	6.1 <i>Status report from Operating Agent</i>	W4
	6.2 <i>Budget 2023</i>	W5
	6.3 <i>ETSAP-TIAM</i>	
7	OTHER BUSINESS	
	7.1 <i>90th ExCo meeting (15 June) and summer WS (15-16 June)</i>	
	7.2 <i>Other meetings:</i>	
	a) <i>91st ExCo meeting (online)</i>	
	b) <i>ETSAP winter WS and 92nd ExCo meeting: Italy</i>	
	7.3 <i>AOB</i>	

Attachments

W1 Draft minutes and Action list from the 88th ExCo meeting, December 2, 2022
W2 Update from IEA Secretariat
W3 ETSAP Economy 2020-2022
W4 Report from OA to ETSAP ExCo 1 March 2023
W5 ETSAP budget 2023

1. QUORUM COUNT

Quorum is 12. A quorum was present as 14 delegates were present (online).

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

The agenda was adopted. No AOB.

3. MINUTES OF THE 88TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

3.1 Minutes of the 88th Executive Committee - (Attachment W1)

The ExCo adopted the minutes.

3.2 Matters arising

The Chair opened a discussion about the scoring of project proposals, raising a concern that the ETSAP project selection process does not include a clear definition of the criteria used. This may mean that different delegates are voting based on their own interpretation of the selection criteria, and he recalled the decision of the 69th ExCo meeting in Cork, May 30 2016, specifically that

*delegates decided to update the evaluation of ETSAP projects procedure by interpreting the **participation** criteria as the number of partners who participate or will benefit from the project to rebalance between collective activities (e.g. workshops with potentially many partners involved) and tools development (with potentially many partners benefitting).*

After some discussion the ExCo agreed that i) clear definitions of the selection criteria should be incorporated into the project selection score sheet and ii) the scoring for projects that took place during the 88th ExCo meeting selection process should be redone at the 90th ExCo meeting.

Regarding point 3.2.ii above, the key concern relates to the ‘participation’ criteria and the ExCo agreed that repeat voting will be limited to project proposals that were close to (but below) reaching the overall threshold required for funding. Projects that have already been approved for funding will not be included in, or affected by, this repeat voting. In addition, if the proposal scores change and proposals are deemed fundable, the decision on whether to fund will depend on availability of funds for projects, as discussed in item 6.2 below.

Action List from 88 th ExCo Meeting	Owner
If there is a delay in the meeting documents, the ExCo will be informed by e-mail.	Ongoing - Brian
Support existing ExCo members and engage with interested parties seeking to become Contracting Parties	Ongoing - George/Brian/Kari
Seek to coordinate with IEA on joint training workshops for IEA Association Countries	Ongoing - George / Uwe
Singapore is invited to join ETSAP. We will follow up on signing as Contracting Partner	Done – Singapore CP / George
Extend suspension of Russian Federation from participating in ETSAP TCP activities until there is a change in the circumstances that resulted in the suspension	Ongoing – ExCo
Follow up on invoices for the outstanding 2022 membership fees	Done - Kari/Linda

(France, Korea, Greece and Wallonia, Belgium)	
Send doodle for the 89 th ExCo meeting Spring 2023	Done - Kari
Follow up with IEW 2023 and Colorado School of Mines in order to arrange the ETSAP summer WS in Colorado	Ongoing – ETSAP Management
Continue with ETSAP webinar series – ExCo members to encourage participation and to propose webinar topics to George.	Done – George / Paul / ETSAP CP
Make contracts with the five research projects that reached the threshold	Ongoing - Kari
Engage with ETSAP TIAM core team regarding specification for ETSAP TIAM gatekeeper role	Ongoing – George
Organise 91 st ETSAP ExCo meeting in Fall 2023	Ongoing - Kari
Host ETSAP 92 nd ExCo meeting and Winter Workshop, Milan Italy	Ongoing - Maria (RSE) / Kari

4 IEA-ETSAP IMPLEMENTING AGREEMENT

4.1 Communication from the Secretariat (Attachment W2)

The IEA Secretariat provided a presentation on the recent activities of the IEA:

- Recent publications include Energy Technology Perspectives 2023.
- Recent IEA Commentaries & articles.
- New IEA Working Party on Industrial Decarbonisation has been established.
- Update on the IEA TCP forum activities.

4.2 ETSAP Participation and Outreach activities

The IETS TCP (Industrial Energy-Related Technologies and Systems) reached out to ETSAP to discuss possibilities for collaboration. After a meeting with the ETSAP Management team, it was agreed that Kari will participate in their forthcoming [Energy Future in Industry conference](#) and present on the topic of “The role of industry in energy systems” on May 9- 11th of May in Gothenburg

The ExCo discussed this and agreed that further ETSAP participation would be beneficial. Anna is giving a presentation as well and will coordinate with Kari to align the content.

- DEA would like to participate/ contribute.
- IER is also interested, and the topic is relevant to the new ETSAP project.
- VTT/Tiina is positive to support Kari.
- PSI/Tom will contribute.

Brian suggested that an option for the presentation would be to include slides from each of the national teams on relevant work. Tom Kober pointed out that it is important to demonstrate the modelling capabilities of the ETSAP team. As a clarification Kari noted that there was a request from the organisers to focus on methodological issues and on options for collaboration.

ETSAP has also engaged with the Open Energy Modelling Initiative, leading to an article on the [openmod forum](https://forum.openmod.org/t/update-on-the-times-ecosystem/3778) <https://forum.openmod.org/t/update-on-the-times-ecosystem/3778>

ANNEX XV (2020-2022): ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS



ETSAP has engaged with IEA on critical minerals. Brian participated in the *1st meeting of the Critical Minerals TCP Coordination Group*, and VTT/Tiina is interested in this topic.

ETSAP has engaged further with Singapore and Dr Aloisius Rabata Purnama informed the ExCo that the agreement was approved today, news well received by the ExCo. The ExCo is expecting to fully welcome Singapore to be the next ETSAP contracting party.

ETSAP is participating in the Clean Energy Ministerial LTES - Long-term energy scenarios initiative, which is co-ordinated by IRENA. A question was raised if an institution could participate in the LTES as an ETSAP member, even though participation to the initiative was not funded by the government (Sweden). Brian commented that this not a barrier for Sweden to participate in LTES as an ETSAP member. Tiina noted that Finland has joined LTES without financing.

5. ANNEX XV (2020-2022): ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS

5.1 Economy 2022 (Attachment W3)

The 88th ExCo meeting decided to transfer €150k from 2022 to 2023. In addition, the 88th ExCo meeting decided to allocate up to €250k to collaborative research and model development projects. In addition the funding for the ETSAP-TIAM project was reserved from the 2021 budget. This means there is a further €160k remaining in the 2022 budget and this 89th ExCo agreed to transfer this €160k to the 2023 ETSAP budget. The overall budget shows a positive economic position.

Out of the €250k allocated to fund projects in 2022, the 88th ExCo agreed to contract projects totalling €204k. In light of the decision taken earlier in this 89th ExCo meeting (3.2.ii above, i.e. that repeat voting will take place, limited to project proposals that were close to (but below) reaching the overall threshold), namely

1. P09 VEDA Online for ETSAP Contracting Parties (Score 68.7)
2. P02 Free online VEDA-TIMES Platform for Students (Score 67.4)

Brian suggested voting in the 90th ExCo meeting be limited to the two projects that were on the threshold in the voting that took place in the 88th ExCo meeting, and that the budget allocation (if either or both of these projects reach the threshold) be limited to €60k. A number of delegates commented that this is reasonable and the ExCo agreed on this course of action.

5.2 Annual report 2022

In order to publish the annual report for 2022, a questionnaire was sent, and information was requested by the CPs and the experts. So far ETSAP has only received contributions from seven CPs and five contracted experts. All contracting parties are encouraged to send their contribution within the next week, to be able to show in the annual report the work done by the community. CPs that cannot provide input within next week should contact Kari. A follow-up email will be sent to remind all CPs for this contribution.

6 ANNEX XVI (2023-2025): ALIGNING ENERGY SECURITY WITH ZERO EMISSIONS ENERGY SYSTEMS

6.1 Status report from Operating Agent

W4

One of the projects approved for funding by the 88th ExCo meeting was the publication of the third ETSAP / Springer book, entitled *Energy Systems Models and Sustainable Development Goals*. Springer has raised the possibility of making the book open-access at a cost of ~€13k. A number of delegates welcomed this option, highlighting the multiple benefits of increased openness and transparency. It reflects the journey many delegates are on and also the journey ETSAP is on. The ExCo approved this proposal to allocate the funding to enable this book be open-access.

The ETSAP Management team encourages all CPs to send contributions to Maryse Labriet at maryse.labriet@gmail.com. There is still the possibility to contribute with chapters that are within the topic of the book.

6.2 Budget 2023

W5

The detailed budget was discussed and is available as an excel file in the ExCo Teams folder. A summary of agreed expenditure to date for 2023 is shown in the table below.

Management	103,600
Project Head	13,000
Secretariat (Operating Agent)	27,000
Workshops	50,000
Sponsoring IEW	6,000
Bank expenses	600
Other, contingency	2,000
Auditing	5,000
Licenses, Tools Maintenance and improvements	69,000
VEDA licenses to the CP	36,000
TIMES	20,000
PSC / LO (combined with 2.1) New name: Liaison officer	13,000
Diffusion, capacity building	67,000
ETSAP News in social media	2,000
Website Maintenance and development	5,000
Training courses	30,000
Training Material	10,000
Other - Tosato Grant	10,000
Annual Report	10,000
Research and Development	249,700
Model of industry sector and material efficiency	46,000
Open Source TIMES Excel Reader	50,000
Review of the TIMES code in GAMS to identify areas for performance improvements	48,500
Third ETSAP book: Energy System Models and Suitable Development Goal	12,200
Times extension for electricity, gas, hydrogen and CO2 transport infrastructures	48,000
Setting up ETSAP-TIAM on Git-Hub and making it available for the ExCo members	5,000
ETSAP TIAM Documentation and Validation	40,000

6.3 ETSAP-TIAM

The ETSAP-TIAM group are working on proposed next steps and will come back to the 90th ExCo with specific suggestions related to the gate-keeper role and how wider improvement to ETSAP-TIAM can be maintained through project proposals. Markus provided a status update on the status: Internal meetings within the group took place and the key decisions are: The GitHub structure will be developed, and an evaluation of ETSAP-TIAM will be performed when developing the documentation. The definition of the role of the gatekeeper is ongoing.

The openness of ETSAP-TIAM has also been discussed and is still an open issue, mainly related to the use of proprietary IEA energy balance data. There are two possible options:

- Option 1 – Only present a limited energy balance in the model templates.
- Option 2 – Use a piping tool that creates vt files based on energy balances.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

7.1 90th ExCo meeting (15 June) and ETSAP Summer WS (15-16 June): Back-to back with IEW in Colorado.

The **deadline for abstract submission for the ETSAP Workshop has been set to the 14th of April 2023**. Brian raised a concern regarding timing of IEW. The choice of Tuesday to Thursday constrains the timing of the ETSAP's workshop, pushing us to a weekend workshop as we experienced previously in Stockholm) or overlap with IEW (as we have this year on June 15). From discussions with the local IEW team (in Colorado responsible for organising the workshop) they were not aware of this issue. We will further engage with the IEW co-ordinating team to seek to ensure IEW is Mon-Wed or Wed-Fri in future.

Brian contacted IEW regarding sponsorship of IEW and the use of meeting rooms. ETSAP team will contribute the dialogue, including find suggested hotels etc.

7.2 Other meetings:

a) 91st ExCo meeting (online)

The ExCo agreed we will aim for early September for the 91st ExCo meeting, and the timing of the meeting will be set to be convenient for the Eastern Hemisphere.

b) ETSAP winter WS and 92nd ExCo meeting: Italy

The ETSAP Winter Workshop and 92nd ExCo meeting will take place in November in Italy.

The "Summer School" funded by ETSAP will take place in the week of the 6th of November.

7.3 AOB

Tiina updated the ExCo that the IEA TCP on bioenergy contacted her and discussed the option for a common workshop. One option is to have the WS in parallel with winter workshop in Italy.

8. AGREED ACTIONS

Action List from 88 th ExCo Meeting	Owner
If there is a delay in the meeting documents, the ExCo will be informed by e-mail.	Ongoing - Brian
Support existing ExCo members and engage with interested parties seeking to become Contracting Parties	Ongoing - George/Brian/Kari
Seek to coordinate with IEA on joint training workshops for IEA Association Countries	Ongoing - George / Uwe
Extend suspension of Russian Federation from participating in ETSAP TCP activities until there is a change in the circumstances that resulted in the suspension	Ongoing – ExCo
Include clear definitions of the selection criteria should be incorporated into the project selection score sheet	George
Organise repeat voting in the 90 th ExCo for projects that failed to meet the threshold for funding in the 88 th ExCo, limited to project proposals that were close to (but below) reaching the overall threshold), namely 1. P09 VEDA Online for ETSAP Contracting Parties (Score 68.7) 2. P02 Free online VEDA-TIMES Platform for Students (Score 67.4)	George
ETSAP will participate in IETS TCP <i>Energy Future in Industry</i> conference and present on the topic of “The role of industry in energy systems” on May 9- 11th of May in Gothenburg	Kari, Anna, DEA, IER, VTT, PSI
Reserve €60k for two projects to be voted on in 90 th ExCo	Kari
Transfer €160k from 2022 to 2023 ETSAP budget	Kari
Send updates on 2022 activities to Kathleen for inclusion in ETSAP 2022 annual report	All CPs who haven’t done so
Allocate ~€13k to enable Springer make ETSAP book <i>Energy Systems Models and Sustainable Development Goals</i> open-access	Kari
Send proposed contributions for chapters for forthcoming ETSAP book to Maryse Labriet at maryse.labriet@gmail.com	All CPs who haven’t done so
ETSAP-TIAM group to provide specific suggestions to 90 th ExCo related to the gate-keeper role and how wider improvement to ETSAP-TIAM can be maintained through project proposals	Markus
Send and follow up for the invoices for the fees of 2023	Kari/Linda
Send doodle for the 90 th ExCo meeting	Kari
Follow up with IEW 2023 and Colorado School of Mines in order to arrange the ETSAP summer WS and ExCo in Colorado	Brian/George/Kari
Continue with ETSAP webinar series – ExCo members to encourage participation and to propose webinar topics to George.	Ongoing – George / Paul / ETSAP CP