

ANNEX XV (2020-2022):
ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS

DRAFT MINUTES OF THE 88TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

Date: Friday, December 02, 2022 (14:00 - 17.00 US ES)
 Venue: Faculty House, Columbia University, New York, USA, New York
 Zoom link for those who did not attend in person.
 Contacts: James Glynn (james.glynn@columbia.edu), Kari Espegren, (kari.esepgren@ife.no),
 Brian Ó Gallachóir (b.ogallachoir@ucc.ie), George Giannakidis
 (ggiannakidis.gg@gmail.com)

Table 1: Participants

N.	Country	Participant	Delegate	Attended	Stand-ins
1	Australia	CSIRO	Mr. Luke REEDMAN	Yes	
2	Belgium	VITO/SPW/Brussels	Mr. Frank Meinke-Hubeny	Yes	Pieter Lodewijks
3	Denmark	ENS	Mr. Kristoffer Steen Andersen	Yes	Simon Brøndum Andersen
4	Finland	VTT/Business Finland	Jussi Mäkelä	Yes	Tiina Koljonen, Vice Chair
5	France	ADEME/EDMP/ DGEMPEDAD	Mr. Emmanuel Combet Ms Nadia Maisi	No	
6	Germany	IER	Mr. Markus BLESL, Vice chair	Yes	
7	Greece	CRES	Mr. Philip Siakkis	Yes	George Giannakidis
8	Italy	ENEA	Ms. Maria Gaeta	Yes	
9	Ireland	SEAI	Mr. Brian Ó GALLACHÓIR, Chair	Yes	
10	Japan	IEEJ	Mr. Yuhji MATSUO	No	
11	Kazakhstan	NURIS		No	
12	Korea	KEA	Ms. HoChul Shin	Yes	
13	Netherlands	TNO	Mr. Bob van der ZWAAN	No	
14	New Zealand	EECA	Mr. Vincent Smart	Yes	
15	Norway	IFE	Ms. Kari Aamodt ESPEGREN	Yes	
16	Russia			No	
17	Spain	CIEMAT	Ms. Yolanda Lechón	Yes	
18	Sweden	STEM	Ms. Josefin THORESSON	Yes	Anna Krook-Riekkola
19	Switzerland	PSI	Ms. Anne-Kathrin FAUST	Yes	Tom Kober
20	UK	BEIS	Mr. Barry-Jon de Souza	No	Paul Dodds (attended late)
21	US	DOE	Mr. Sauleh A. Siddiqui	Yes	
22	Sponsor	ENEL Foundation	Mr. Carlo PAPA	yes	Claudio Pregagnoli

OFFICERS AND GUESTS

Uwe Remme	IEA, Paris, France	Maurizio Gargiulo	E4SMA, Italy
Gary Goldstein	Decisionware, USA	Kathleen Vaillancourt	ESMIA, Canada
James Glynn	Univ of Columbia, USA	Pernille Seljom	IFE, Norway
Antti Lehtila	VTT, Finland	Mari Authen	IFE, Norway
Amit Kanuda	KanOrs, India	Olex Balyk	UCC, Ireland
Christoph Jessen	FZ Juelich, Germany		

ANNEX XV (2020-2022):
ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS

88TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

AGENDA

No.	ITEM	DOCS
1	QUORUM COUNT	
2	ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA	
3	MINUTES OF THE 87TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE	V1
	3.1 Final Minutes of the 87 th Executive Committee	
	3.2 Matters arising	
4	IEA-ETSAP IMPLEMENTING AGREEMENT	
	4.1 Communication from the Secretariat	V2
	4.2 ETSAP Participation and Outreach activities	
5	ANNEX XV (2020-2022): ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS	
	5.1 Status report from Operating Agent	V3
	5.2 Economy 2022 and budget 2023	V4
	5.3 ETSAP-TIAM: revised MoU	V5
	5.4 Project proposals	V6
6	ANNEX XVI (2023-2025): ALIGNING ENERGY SECURITY WITH ZERO EMISSIONS ENERGY SYSTEMS	
	6.1 The work program of Annex XVI	V7
7	OTHER BUSINESS	
	7.1 89 th ExCo meeting: online	
	7.2 Other meetings:	
	a) ETSAP Summer WS and 90 th ExCo meeting. Back-to back with IEW in Colorado (13-15 June)?	
	b) 91 st ExCo meeting (online)	
	c) ETSAP winter WS and 92 nd ExCo meeting: Do anyone offer to host the meeting?	

Attachments

-
- V1 Minutes and Action list from the 87th ExCo meeting, September 12, 2022
 - V2 Communication from IEA Secretariat
 - V3 Status report from Operating Agent
 - V4 ETSAP-TIAM: revised MoU
 - V5 Economy and budget
 - V6 Project proposals
 - V7 Annex XVI work programme (2023-25)

1. QUORUM COUNT

The ExCo Chair opened the meeting and thanked the US hosts for organising a very successful workshop and making all the arrangements for the ExCo meeting.

The quorum is 12. A quorum was present as 16 delegates were present (online and in-person).

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

The ExCo adopted the agenda with no items added under AOB.

3. MINUTES OF THE 87TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

3.1 Minutes of the 87th Executive Committee - (Attachment V1)

The ExCo adopted the minutes.

3.2 Matters arising

Action List from 87 th ExCo Meeting	Owner	Action
If there is a delay in the meeting documents, the ExCo will be informed by e-mail.	Brian	Ongoing
Support existing ExCo members and engage with interested parties seeking to become Contracting Parties	George/Brian/Kari	Ongoing
Seek to coordinate with IEA on joint training workshops for IEA Association Countries	George / Uwe	Ongoing
Invite Singapore and CSER to join ETSAP.	Brian/George	Singapore has not yet signed as CP, but we trust they will sign.
Extend suspension of Russian Federation from participating in ETSAP TCP activities until there is a change in the circumstances that resulted in the suspension	Brian / Kari / George	Ongoing
Prepare format of the ETSAP Annual report 2022	George/Kari/Kathleen	Done
Consider options for ETSAP presence in social media	George/Kari	Kathleen has agreed to work on this
Follow up on invoices for the outstanding 2022 membership fees (Denmark, France, Korea, Italy, Greece and ENEL)	Kari/Linda	Greece, France and Korea have not yet paid.
Establish level of interest in a third ETSAP Book	Interested CPs to contact Maryse. Brian: follow up.	Done
Issue call for research proposals to be evaluated and decided on at the 88 th ExCo meeting	Brian/Kari	Done. Available on the Teams folder.
Circulate the final Annex XVI text to be approved before the 88 th ExCo meeting	George/Brian/Kari	Done. Available on the Teams folder.

Introduce a sunset clause (with single maximum extension of 12 months) in all new ETSAP project contracts	Kari	Done
Continue with ETSAP webinar series – ExCo members to encourage participation and to propose webinar topics to George.	George / Paul / ETSAP CP	We have not received any proposals since last ExCo. Invitations remains open
88 th ExCo Meeting to take place in New York on Dec 1-2 hosted by USA (EIA and Columbia University)	Angelina / James / Kari	Arranged with much support from CU
90 th ExCo (summer 2023): Consider whether the meeting and summer workshop will take place alongside IEW 41 in Colorado in June 13-15, 2023.	CPs	Decision taken at 88 th ExCo
91 nd ExCo (winter 2023): Consider if your institute can host for the 2023 winter meeting and notify ETSAP OA (Kari) before the 88 th ExCo-meeting	CPs	Decision taken at 88 th ExCo. RSE, Milan, Italy

4 IEA-ETSAP IMPLEMENTING AGREEMENT

4.1 Communication from the Secretariat (Attachment V2)

The IEA Secretariat (Dr. Uwe Remme) provided an overview of recent activities and the following reports have recently been released by the IEA:

- Future of heat pumps (released this week)
- WEO: Using a new modelling framework. Global energy and simulation model, also using TIMES. More information at the IEA web page on the global energy and climate model

Coming IEA reports:

- Report on Strategies for Europe on gas situation
- ETP will be released in January 2023: Focus is energy supply chains that are *secure, resilient and reliable*. Linking with material processing and minerals.

IEA have a new activity related to supply chains for critical minerals. Mandate to include critical minerals and have established a new coordination group on critical minerals. Interested TCPs are invited to nominate a representative to work on activities closely related to critical minerals.

Brian will participate in the first meeting (on the 8th of December). Thereafter Brian will follow up with Tiina (VTT, Finland), James (CU, USA) and anyone who has expressed an interest in critical minerals.

4.2 ETSAP Participation and Outreach activities

ETSAP Management Team sent invitation letters to Portugal and Singapore and a response is pending.

5. ANNEX XV (2020-2022): ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS

5.1 Status report from Operating Agent (Attachment V3)

The status report was prepared by the ETSAP OA (Kari) and is attached as V3. Key points from the report are:

ANNEX XV (2020-2022):
ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS



- The contracts for new research projects have been simplified, and the sunset clause included.
- Five online ETSAP training sessions and one in-person training have been delivered in 2022.
- In total four ETSAP webinars have been organised.
- Annual report 2022:
 - Kathleen has provided two new questionnaires: one for CPs and one for ETSAP experts.
 - Deadline 31st of January to answer survey. In case you do not have time to answer the questionnaire, please provide links to Kathleen for related activity and publications.
 - One study per year per contracting party is enough.
 - Provide original source of pictures to make a report of good quality.
- Two meetings were held with the World Bank to discuss the possibility of using ETSAP tools in the decarbonisation pathways analysis that the WB is performing.

5.2 Economy and budget (Attachment V4)

Planning year	2022					
Planned and Actual	2020		2021		2022	
Income Membership	Actual	410 000	Actual	380 000	Actual	333 000
Income Membership (late)	Late Actual	-	Late Actual	20 000	Late Actual	40 000
Income (training, change OA, transfer funds)	Actual	674 919	Actual	11 650	Actual	10 900
Income from previous year	Actual	-	Actual	602 498	Actual	875 982
Total income		1 084 919		1 014 148		1 259 882
Base Activities	Actual	482 421	Actual	108 166	Actual	79 790
Coordinated Projects	Actual	-	Actual	30 000	Actual	106 455
Total costs		482 421		138 166		186 245
Balance		602 498		875 982		1 073 637
Transfer of income						
Transfer of funds for ETSAP-TIAM development	Budget		Budget	40 000	Budget	
Transfer Income (Core activities)	Budget	150 000	Budget	150 000	Budget	150 000
Total transfer income		150 000		190 000		150 000
Commitments						
Base Activities (contracted not invoiced)	Commitments	14 000	Commitments	40 901	Commitment	181 811
Coordinated Projects (new)	Approved	159 100	Approved	129 000	Approved	-
Coordinated Projects (from prev.years)	Commitments	290 555	Commitments	419 655	Commitment	442 200
Total Commitments		463 655		589 556		624 011
Balance		- 11 157		96 426		299 626
Commitments transferd to next year		463 655		589 556		624 011
Income transferd to next year		452 498		685 982		923 637
New Balance		0		0		0

A summary of income and expenditure for 2022 was provided by the Operating Agent (Kari) (See Table above from November 30, 2022). Regarding the payment of the 2022 fees, France, Korea, Greece and Belgium have yet to pay in full. The OA is positive about the prospects of having membership fees paid from these countries.

The proposed budget for 2023 was presented to the ExCo, with the following notes:

- Small increase for Project Head and Operating Agent relative to 2022
- OA is seeking to reduce the cost for auditing

ANNEX XV (2020-2022):
 ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS

- MARKA/TIMES starter support and Liaison Officer roles combined into one contract, to make the administration easier. Small reduction in budget.
- TIMES management - small increase relative to 2022.
- A small contract with Kathleen on ETSAP in social media is included.
- Website maintenance cost reduced relative to 2022.
- Cost of training increased relative to 2022, due to increased number of training sessions and increased payment rate for training provision.
- Training fee for companies and institutions increased, but no increase for university or students.
- Training materials: €10,000 is set aside for materials to enhance the online training sessions.
- Tosato Grant: Can be used for in-person training.

The ExCo decided to transfer €150,000 from 2022 budget to 2023 to contribute to essential costs, and agreed the budget expenditure of €239,600 for 2023, including the above items, as outlined per the table below for details.

	2020		2021		2022		2023	
	Invoiced/ Contracted	Actual	Invoiced/ Contracted	Actual	Invoiced/ Contracted	Actual	Budget	Actual
Balance	374 743	297 943	745 481	395 426	965 182	409 626	-239 600	0
Income	1 124 919	1 084 919	411 650	391 650	408 900	343 900	-	-
Income transferd	-	-	602 498	602 498	875 982	875 982	-	-
Expences base activities incl. Late invoiced	496 421	482 421	135 067	118 166	220 700	79 790	239 600	-
Expences base activities - Commitments	-	14 000	-	40 901	-	181 811	-	-
Expences coordinated projects - NEW	253 755	-	133 600	20 000	99 000	106 455	-	-
Expences coordinated projects - Commitments	-	290 555	-	419 655	-	442 200	-	-
Filter cells								
Management	37 221	37 221	41 367	41 367	98 000	18 790	103 600	-
Project Head	12 000	12 000	12 000	12 000	12 000	6 000	13 000	-
Secretariat (Operating Agent)	25 000	25 000	25 000	25 000	25 000	-	27 000	-
Workshops	-	-	1 405	1 405	50 000	1 303	50 000	-
Sponsoring IEW	-	-	-	-	6 000	6 000	6 000	-
Bank expenses	-	-	508	508	-	487	600	-
Other, contingency	221	221	831	831	-	-	2 000	-
Auditing	-	-	1 623	1 623	5 000	5 000	5 000	-
Licenses, Tools Maintenance and inprovementns	386 700	371 700	38 700	34 799	80 700	36 000	69 000	-
MARKAL and TIMES-Starter Support (combined with 2.	3 300	3 300	3 300	-	3 300	-	-	-
ANSWER licenses to the CP (finnished)	6 000	6 000	6 000	2 000	-	-	-	-
VEDA licenses to the CP	18 000	18 000	18 000	18 000	36 000	36 000	36 000	-
TIMES	18 000	18 000	-	-	30 000	-	20 000	-
PSC / LO (combinded with 2.1) New name: Liaison offi	11 400	11 400	11 400	14 799	11 400	-	13 000	-
Diffusion, capacity building	72 500	73 500	55 000	42 000	42 000	25 000	67 000	-
ETSAP News in social media	-	-	-	-	2 000	-	2 000	-
Website Maintenance and development	10 000	10 000	10 000	10 000	10 000	10 000	5 000	-
Training courses	19 000	25 000	35 000	22 000	20 000	15 000	30 000	-
Training Material	20 000	15 000	-	-	-	-	10 000	-
Other - Tosato Grant	-	-	-	-	-	-	10 000	-
Annual Report	-	-	10 000	10 000	10 000	-	10 000	-

The ExCo also decided to allocate up to €250,000 to project proposals and to hold €50,000 in reserve.

5.3. ETSAP-TIAM: documentation and Revised ETSAP-TIAM MoU (Attachment V5)

The ExCo considered the proposal received from IER for documentation relating to ETSAP-TIAM and approved releasing the €40,000 (previously from the 2021 budget for this purpose).

The ETSAP Chair introduced the new ETSAP-TIAM MoU and invited for a discussion in the ExCo.

**ANNEX XV (2020-2022):
ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS**

The ExCo agreed on the importance of having a transparent and open global ETSAP-TIAM model. There are two main tasks; firstly the “gatekeeper” task, delivering ETSAP-TIAM maintenance activities and data updates, and secondly, updating and improving the model.

The MoU proposes a core group, and a group of observers. How the tasks will be divided among the partners is not yet clear. The ExCo agreed that the specification of gatekeeper role will be important, pointing to suggested tasks are described in MoU.

The ExCo considered positively the MoU suggestion that an annual budget be allocated for the gate keeper role, whereas project updates and developments be proposed under the annual ETSAP call for projects.

The ExCo agreed that the core group should specify more explicitly the role of the gatekeeper, and the associated requested annual budget for this role. George will follow up with Markus and the core group for ETSAP-TIAM.

5.4 Project proposals (Attachment V6)

The ExCo considered nine submitted proposals, voted on them, and the following five projects passed the scoring threshold (70 points):

1. Third ETSAP book: Energy System Models and Suitable Development Goals
2. Times extension for electricity, gas, hydrogen and CO2 transport infrastructures
3. Model of industry sector and material efficiency
4. Review of the TIMES code in GAMS to identify areas for performance improvements
5. Open Source TIMES Excel Reader

These projects collectively costed €204.700, and the ExCo approved them for funding.

6 ANNEX XVI (2023-2025)

6.1 The work program of Annex XVI

The ETSAP Management team included a summary and circulated the final version of the agreed work programme of Annex XVI in advance of the 88th ExCo meeting.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

7.1 The ExCo agreed that the 89th ExCo meeting will be virtual in February/ March 2023. Kari will send a Doodle poll.

7.2 Other meetings:

- The ExCo decided to hold the 90th ExCo-meeting and the summer workshop alongside the IEW in Colorado in Summer 2023. The ETSAP ExCo meeting will take place in the morning of June 15th and the ETSAP Summer workshop in the afternoon of June 15th and on June 16th.
- ETSAP Management will communicate with the IEW committee to indicate strong preference for future IEWs to be held on Mon-Wed or Wed-Fri, so that ETSAP Summer meetings do not overlap with IEW. The ExCo agreed that we will sponsor IEW to the amount

of €6,000, but that this is conditional on reasonable costs for arranging our ETSAP workshop in Colorado.

- The ExCo decided that the 91st ExCo in Fall 2023 will be virtual.
- Maria Gaeta from RSE in Italy offered to host the 92nd ExCo Meeting and the ETSAP winter 2023 workshop in Milan in late November or early December. The ExCo accepted this kind offer.

8. AGREED ACTIONS

Action List from 88 th ExCo Meeting	Owner
If there is a delay in the meeting documents, the ExCo will be informed by e-mail.	Brian (ongoing)
Support existing ExCo members and engage with interested parties seeking to become Contracting Parties	George/Brian/Kari (ongoing)
Seek to coordinate with IEA on joint training workshops for IEA Association Countries	George / Uwe (ongoing).
Singapore is invited to join ETSAP. We will follow up on signing as Contracting Partner	Brian/George/Kari
Extend suspension of Russian Federation from participating in ETSAP TCP activities until there is a change in the circumstances that resulted in the suspension	Brian / Kari / George
Follow up on invoices for the outstanding 2022 membership fees (France, Korea, Greece and Wallonia, Belgium)	Kari/Linda
Send doodle for the 89 th ExCo meeting Spring 2023	Kari
Follow up with IEW 2023 and Colorado School of Mines in order to arrange the ETSAP summer WS in Colorado	Brian/George/Kari
Continue with ETSAP webinar series – ExCo members to encourage participation and to propose webinar topics to George.	George / Paul / ETSAP CP
Make contracts with the five research projects that reached the threshold	Kari
Engage with ETSAP TIAM core team regarding specification for ETSAP TIAM gatekeeper role	George / Markus
Organise 91 st ETSAP ExCo meeting in Fall 2023	Kari
Host ETSAP 92 nd ExCo meeting and Winter Workshop, Milan Italy	Maria (RSE) / Kari