

ANNEX XV (2020-2022):
ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS

MINUTES OF THE 87TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

Date: Monday, September 12, 2022 (12:00 - 14.00 CET)
Venue: Online meeting,
Contacts: Kari Espegren, (kari.esepgren@ife.no), Brian Ó Gallachóir (b.ogallachoir@ucc.ie),
George Giannakidis (ggiannakidis.gg@gmail.com)

TABLE 1: PARTICIPANTS

N.	Country	Participant	Delegate	Attended	Stand-ins
1	Australia	CSIRO	Mr. Luke REEDMAN	No	
2	Belgium	VITO/SPW/Brussels	Mr. Frank Meinke-Hubeny	Yes	Pieter Lodewijks
3	Denmark	ENS	Mr. Kristoffer Steen Andersen	Yes	
4	Finland	VTT/Business Finland	Jussi Mäkelä	Yes	Tiina Koljonen, Vice Chair
5	France	ADEME/EDMP/ DGEMPEDAD	Mr. Emmanuel Combet Ms Nadia Maisi	No	
6	Germany	IER	Mr. Markus BLESL, Vice chair	Yes	
7	Greece	CRES	Mr. Philip Siakkis	No	
8	Italy	ENEA	Ms. Maria Gaeta	Yes	
9	Ireland	SEAI	Mr. Brian Ó GALLACHÓIR, Chair	Yes	
10	Japan	IEEJ	Mr. Yuhji MATSUO	Yes	Seiya Endo
11	Kazakhstan	NURIS		No	
12	Korea	KEA	Ms. HoChul Shin	Yes	Ahn Sang Soo
13	Netherlands	TNO	Mr. Bob van der ZWAAN	Yes	Francesco De la Longa
14	New Zealand	EECA	Mr. Vincent Smart	No	
15	Norway	IFE	Ms. Kari Aamodt ESPEGREN	Yes	
16	Russia			No	
17	Spain	CIEMAT	Ms. Yolanda Lechón	Yes	
18	Sweden	STEM	Ms. Josefin THORESSON	Yes	Anna Krook-Riekkola
19	Switzerland	PSI	Ms. Anne-Kathrin FAUST	Yes	Tom Kober
20	UK	BEIS	Mr. Barry-Jon de Souza	No	
21	US	DOE	Ms Angelina LaRose	Yes	
22	Sponsor	ENEL Foundation	Mr. Carlo PAPA	No	

OFFICERS AND GUESTS

David Daniels	Chalmers Univ., Sweden	Kathleen Vaillancourt	ESMIA, Canada
George Giannakidis	ETSAP Project Head	Maurizio Gargiulo	E4SMA, Italy
Uwe Remme	IEA, Paris, France	Kenneth Karlsson	EML, Denmark
Gary Goldstein	Decisionware, USA	Fred Fiand	GAMS
James Glynn	Univ of Columbia, USA	Aloisius Rabata	A*STAR, Singapore
Antti Lehtila	VTT, Finland	Victor Nian	CSER, Singapore
Pádraig Daly	SEAI, Ireland	Pernille Seljom	IFE, Norway
Sauleh A. Siddiqui	EIA, USA		

ANNEX XV (2020-2022):
ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS

86TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

AGENDA

No.	ITEM	DOCS
1	QUORUM COUNT	
2	ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA	
3	MINUTES OF THE 86TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE	U1
	3.1 <i>Final Minutes of the 87th Executive Committee</i>	
	3.2 <i>Matters arising</i>	
4	IEA-ETSAP IMPLEMENTING AGREEMENT	
	4.1 <i>Communication from the Secretariat</i>	U2
	4.2 <i>ETSAP Participation and Outreach activities</i>	
	4.2.a <i>Russian participation in ETSAP</i>	
5	ANNEX XV (2020-2022): ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS	
	5.1 <i>Status report from Operating Agent</i>	U3
	5.2 <i>Economy and budget</i>	U4
	5.3 <i>Update on ETSAP funded projects</i>	U5
6	ANNEX XVI (2023-2025)	
	6.1 <i>Discussion of work program</i>	U6
7	OTHER BUSINESS	
	7.1 <i>88th ExCo meeting and Winter WS (in-person): 1-2. December 2022, Columbia University, New York, USA</i>	
	7.2 <i>Discuss date and place: 89th ExCo meeting, ETSAP Summer WS, 90th ExCo meeting</i>	

Attachments

-
- U1 Minutes and Action list from the 86th ExCo meeting, May 23, 2022
 - U2 Communication from IEA Secretariat
 - U3 Status report from Operating Agent
 - U4 Economy and budget
 - U5 List of ongoing ETSAP funded Projects
 - U6 Draft Annex XVI work programme (2023-25)

ANNEX XV (2020-2022):
ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS

1. QUORUM COUNT

Quorum is 12. A quorum was present as 14 delegates were present.

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

The agenda was adopted.

3. MINUTES OF THE 86TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

3.1 Minutes of the 86th Executive Committee - (Attachment U1)

The ExCo adopted the minutes.

3.2 Matters arising

Action List from 86 th ExCo Meeting	Owner	Action
If there is a delay in the meeting documents, the ExCo will be informed by e-mail.	Brian	Ongoing
Support existing ExCo members and engage with interested parties seeking to become Contracting Parties	George/Brian/Kari (ongoing)	Ongoing
Inform IEA of ETSAP decision to suspend Russian Federation from participating in ETSAP activities	Brian	Done
Seek to coordinate with IEA on joint training workshops for IEA Association Countries	George / Uwe (ongoing).	Ongoing
Submit an updated proposal for the ETSAP-TIAM (budget reserved up to €40k)	Markus on behalf of ETSAP TIAM Users Group by July 1 st	Not submitted - see Item 5.3.
ExCo to use written procedure to decide on ETSAP-TIAM Proposal	ExCo Chair and CPs	Not applicable as proposal was not submitted.
Coordinate with the ETSAP-TIAM user group to prepare a detailed costed proposal for the 87 th ExCo for the proposed processes for progressing TIAM in the medium term (the MoU, gatekeeper, engagement processes, and understanding the challenges to make it open source (including licensing issues with IEA and other data used in the model)).	George/Brian/Kari and the ETSAP-TIAM Users Group	Not submitted - see Item 5.3
Consider ETSAP presence in social media	To examine alternative options George/Kari	Activity is on hold. ETSAP partners can propose project.
Follow up on invoices for two outstanding 2021 membership fees and for 2022 fees.	Kari/Linda.	Ongoing
Finalise and publish ETSAP annual report.	ETSAP CPs, Kari/Kathleen Brian/George	Done. Brian has given two presentations of the report (EIA and Columbia University) with positive feedback.

Establish level of interest in a third ETSAP Book	Interested CPs to contact Maryse	Suggested topic: Energy Systems Modelling and Energy Security (linking SDG 13 and SDG 7).
CPs to submit ideas before 87 th ExCo meeting on the content of Annex XVI 2023-2025 Work Programme entitled “ <i>Aligning energy security with zero emission energy systems</i> ”	CPs	Completed
ExCo decided that IFE remains the OA and George remains the Project head for Annex XVI	Kari / George	Incorporated in Annex XVI
Circulate revised Annex XVI draft to be discussed and approved in the 87 th ExCo meeting	George / Kari	Done
ExCo agreed to maintain the same processes for ETSAP funding allocation going forward.	Kari	Issue call for proposals before the December ExCo.
Introduce a sunset clause (with single maximum extension of 12 months) in all new ETSAP project contracts	Kari	To be included in new project contracts.
Continue with ETSAP webinar series – ExCo members to encourage participation and to propose webinar topics to George.	George / Paul / ETSAP CP	Ongoing
87 th ExCo meeting to take place virtually on Sept 12 at 12.00 CET	Kari / Brian	Arranged
88 th ExCo Meeting to take place in New York on Dec 1-2 hosted by USA (EIA and Columbia University)	Angelina / James / Kari	Ongoing

4 IEA-ETSAP IMPLEMENTING AGREEMENT

4.1 Communication from the Secretariat (Attachment U2)

The IEA Secretariat (Dr. Uwe Remme) provided an overview of recent activities at the IEA. Several reports are in preparation, including the Breakthrough Agenda Report jointly with IRENA and the UN High level Champions on progress in reducing emissions in five key sectors (power, hydrogen, road transport, steel and agriculture), the Global Hydrogen Review, Tracking Clean Energy Progress and the World Energy Outlook. The IEA also published a joint IEA-TCP report “Technology and innovation pathways for zero-carbon-ready buildings by 2030” in September. The report was developed by IEA analysis collaborating with experts from 11 TCPs.

The IEA is also preparing the next edition of Energy Technology Perspectives for January next year, which will focus on supply chains for clean energy technologies. Reports looking at supply chains for electric vehicles and solar PV were already published earlier this year.

The IEA has been in contact with UN ECLA (UN Economic Commission for Latin America and the Caribbean) on a potential virtual workshop on energy planning and modelling with experts from the region and international experts such as ETSAP. The preparation of such workshop is still at an early

ANNEX XV (2020-2022): ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS



stage; the IEA Secretariat will follow up with the ExCo Chair and interested ETSAP members. The following parties expressed interest:

- Belgium: VITO are interested in contributing and have relevant activity.
- Switzerland: PSI has not done much the last few years, but is interested in participating.
- Maurizio Gargiulo: E4SMA are interested and are doing relevant modelling.

4.2 ETSAP Participation and Outreach activities

The ExCo warmly welcomed three new ExCo representatives, who introduced themselves to the meeting:

- Ahn Sang Soo, KEA, Korea: Second time in ExCo -meeting. Like to share modelling experience and knowledge. Works with analysis of GHG reductions.
- Seiya Endo, IEEJ, Japan: Energy modelling, power modelling, economic modelling, low carbon transition.
- Suleah Siddiqui, EIA, USA: Chief modeller at EIA in long-term modelling.

The ExCo also welcomed two guests from Singapore, who introduced themselves and who have expressed interest in joining ETSAP:

- Aloisius Rabata, SimTech A*STAR: public research. Modelling energy and emission targets, pathways to net zero using TIMES. Singapore is interested in joining ETSAP, as a Contracting Partner.
- Victor Nian, CSER: Strategic think tank located in Singapore. Work mainly in South-east Asia. How to achieve climate targets. CSER is considering the possibility of joining ETSAP, as a sponsor.

The ETSAP ExCo unanimously decided to invite Singapore to join ETSAP as a contracting party, and to invite Centre for Strategic Energy & Resources in Singapore to join ETSAP as an observer.

The invitation letter has been issued to Portugal to enable participation in ETSAP as a Contracting Partner. ETSAP is waiting for response.

4.2.a Russian participation in ETSAP

The ExCo chair gave a short introduction to the background for the suspension of the Russian Federation and the decision the ExCo took at the 86th ExCo meeting to suspend Russian Federation.

The Executive Committee decided to extend the suspension of the Russian Federation from participating in ETSAP TCP activities, and will discuss it further once the circumstances which led to the suspension change.

5. ANNEX XV (2020-2022): ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS

5.1 Status report from Operating Agent (Attachment U3)

The status report was prepared by the OA (Kari) and is attached as U3. The key points from the report are:

- The ETSAP Annual report 2020-2021 is finalised and available at the ETSAP webpage.
- The management team is simplifying contracts for new research projects.

ANNEX XV (2020-2022):
ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS

- Four online ETSAP training sessions have been delivered so far in 2022. There will be two more virtual training courses in 2022 and one in person training course, the latter on November 28th to 30th at Columbia University, New York, USA.
- In total there were four ETSAP webinars organised so far this year.

5.2 Economy and budget (Attachment U4)

Planned and Actual	2020		2021		2022	
Income Membership	Actual	410 000	Actual	380 000	Actual	260 000
Income Membership (late)	Late Actual	-	Late Actual	20 000	Late Actual	40 000
Income (training, change OA, transfer funds)	Actual	642 919	Actual	11 650	Actual	42 150
Income from previous year	Actual	-	Actual	807 919	Actual	919 281
Total income		1 052 919		1 219 569		1 261 431
Base Activities	Actual	245 000	Actual	300 288	Actual	92 707
Coordinated Activities	Actual	-	Actual	-	Actual	111 455
Total costs		245 000		300 288		204 162
Balance		807 919		919 281		1 057 269
Commitments						
Base Activities (contracted not invoiced)	Commitments	251 200	Commitments	22 700	Commitments	83 705
Coordinated Projects	Approved	159 100	Approved	129 000	Approved	-
Coordinated Projects (from prev. years)	Commitments	311 555	Commitments	470 655	Commitments	488 200
Transfer of funds for ETSAP-TIAM development	Budget		Budget	40 000	Budget	
Transfer Income (Core activities)	Budget	150 000	Budget	150 000	Budget	150 000
Total Commitments		871 855		812 355		721 904
Balance		- 63 936		106 926		323 871
Commitments transfered to next year		470 655		599 655		488 200
Income transfered to next year		406 719		706 581		
New Balance		0		0		812 071

A summary of economy and budget report was provided by the Operating Agent (Kari) (See Table above from September 5 2022).

Regarding the payment of the 2022 fees, some countries have requested that the invoices are sent later in the year. Income from membership fees reached €280 000 by September 12 2022.

Payment for 2022 are not yet received from the following partners: Denmark, France, Italy, Korea, Greece and ENEL. The countries with missing payments are included in the minutes to inform delegates and other contact persons in the relevant countries/organisations. Two of the contracting parties paid the membership fee for 2021 after the audit in 2022, and the income is included in the 2022 economy.

5.3. Update on ETSAP funded projects (Attachment U5)

A short status for each of the ongoing ETSAP funded research projects were given by the project coordinator. The list with projects (attachment U5) is updated with new assumed end date of the work for each contract (for projects with delays).

“Improving the modelling of energy storage technologies in TIMES via collaboration with TCP Energy -Storage Annex 32”

- TCP Energy storage is finalizing the formulation and documentation of the storage-specific models for electricity and thermal storage technologies.

ANNEX XV (2020-2022):
ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS



- The project is to be finished by the end of this year, and Annex 32 will have its meeting on the 3d of October in Ottawa to discuss the closing of the Annex and possible next steps. At the same time, the Annex has collected data and created an openly accessible repository regarding time series on loads, potentials, etc., for different countries.
- Based on the modelling documentation and the data availability, PSI (and IFE) will develop a guide on modelling storage technologies in TIMES in the first quarter of 2023.

“Second Summer School”

- The plan is to reschedule the summer school to take place in 2023.

“Excel technology database for energy system models integrated with TIMES” and “Utilisation of the online platform KAPSARC as a repository for SubRES data”

- Projects are delayed. The first project has proposed a new end date of April 2023.
- Kari will arrange a meeting with Anna to discuss

“Nesting spatial and temporal resolution in the Times source code...”

- The project is delayed and the new proposed end date is June 2023.

“TIMES Cloud Service”

- The service uptake on this project has been quite low. ETSAP partners are highly encouraged to test the TIMES Cloud Service.
- Today there has been 36 users that have used 1300 hours of computational time. Most of the users are related to VEDA online.
- A continuation of the project requires either a new project proposal or an ExCo-decision to include this under a base activity (i.e. under Licenses/tools or capacity building)
- Brian suggests that a presentation by users of the TIMES cloud service is presented at the next ETSAP WS in December to inform the ExCo decision.

“Workshop Series” Improving modelling of 1) behaviour and 2) electricity trade, i.e. two distinct workshop themes.

- scheduled for completion by fall 2023.

“Best practice guide for applying FAIR principles to TIMES models”

- The project has not formally started yet, and is delayed.

“Update the TIMES-Starter SubRES”

- Following the ExCo discussion, Gary will start the work on this project now.
-

“Bridging TIMES-based scenarios and IAMC databases”

- The project is delayed. TNO and ETSAP OA will follow up on this bilaterally.

“ETSAP-TIAM” (new project initiative to finalize the update)

- Due to limited capacity, a proposal to ETSAP has not been submitted as planned. A draft proposal is completed, but it remains to be finalized by all partners.
- IER proposed to arrange an ETAP-TIAM meeting in Stuttgart to discuss recent improvements in modelling of hydrogen and synthetic fuel production and discuss the need for collaboration on further improvements.

5 ANNEX XVI (2023-2025)

The ETSAP Management team circulated a revised the draft work programme for the new Annex based on the discussion in the 86th ExCo-meeting. No comments were received on the draft and the ExCo Members agreed with the contents.

The ETSAP Management team will add a summary and circulate the final version of the Annex in advance of the 88th ExCo meeting.

7. OTHER BUSINESS

7.1 The 88th ExCo meeting at Colombia University in New York will be on either Friday (December 2 2022) in the Afternoon.

7.2 The 89th ExCo meeting in Spring 2023 will be virtual. At the 88th ExCo meeting in December, the ExCo will decide whether the 90th ExCo-meeting will be held alongside the IEW WS in Colorado in Summer 2023.

The 91st ExCo in Fall 2023 will be virtual. The ExCo asked CPs to consider offering to host the 92nd ExCo Meeting and the ETSAP winter 2023 workshop meeting. This will be discussed at the 88th ExCo meeting.

8. AGREED ACTIONS

Action List from 87 th ExCo Meeting	Owner
If there is a delay in the meeting documents, the ExCo will be informed by e-mail.	Brian (ongoing)
Support existing ExCo members and engage with interested parties seeking to become Contracting Parties	George/Brian/Kari (ongoing)
Seek to coordinate with IEA on joint training workshops for IEA Association Countries	George / Uwe (ongoing).
Invite Singapore and CSER to join ETSAP	Brian/George
Extend suspension of Russian Federation from participating in ETSAP TCP activities until there is a change in the circumstances that resulted in the suspension	
Prepare format of the ETSAP Annual report 2023	George/Kari/Kathleen
Consider options for ETSAP presence in social media	George/Kari
Follow up on invoices for the outstanding 2022 membership fees (Denmark, France, Korea, Italy, Greece and ENEL)	Kari/Linda.
Establish level of interest in a third ETSAP Book	Interested CPs to contact Maryse. Brian will follow up.
Issue call for research proposals to be evaluated and decided on at the 88 th ExCo meeting	Brian/Kari
Circulate the final Annex XVI text to be approved before the 88 th ExCo meeting	George/Brian/Kari

ANNEX XV (2020-2022):
ENERGY SYSTEMS AND SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT GOALS



Introduce a sunset clause (with single maximum extension of 12 months) in all new ETSAP project contracts	Kari
Continue with ETSAP webinar series – ExCo members to encourage participation and to propose webinar topics to George.	George / Paul / ETSAP CP
88 th ExCo Meeting to take place in New York on Dec 1-2 hosted by USA (EIA and Columbia University)	Angelina / James / Kari
91 st ExCo (summer 2023): Consider whether the meeting and summer workshop will take place alongside IEW 41 in Colorado in June 13-15 2023	CPs
92 nd ExCo (winter 2023): Consider if your institute can host for the 2023 winter meeting and notify ETSAP OA (Kari) before the 88 th ExCo-meeting	CPs