

75TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

Date: Thursday, June 6, 2019 (14.00 - 18.00)

Host: International Energy Agency (IEA)

Contacts: Kenneth Karlsson, [keka@etsap.org].

MINUTES OF THE 75TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

Held on Thursday, Jun 8, 2019, at UIC-P Espaces Congr s, 16 rue Jean Rey, 75015 Paris, France

TABLE 1: PARTICIPANTS

N.	Country	Participant	Delegate	Attended	Stand-ins
1	Australia	CSIRO	Mr. Luke REEDMAN	Yes	Mr. Brian � GALLACH�IR
2	Belgium	VITO/SPW/Brussels	Mr. Jan DUERINCK	Yes	
3	Denmark	DEA	Mr. Aksel Laurids BECK	Yes	Mr. Kenneth Karlsson, OA
4	EC	JRC Directorate	Mr. Wouter Nijs	No	
5	Finland	VTT/TEKES	Ms. Pia SALOKOSKI	Yes	Ms. Tiina Koljonen
6	France	ADEME/EDMP/ DGEMPEDAD	Mr. Emmanuel Combet	Yes	Ms. Sandrine Selosse
7	Germany	IER	Mr. Markus BLESL, Vice chair	Yes	
8	Greece	CRES	Mr. Philip Siakkis	Yes	
9	Italy	ENEA	Ms. Maria Rosa VIRDIS, Vice Chair	Yes	Ms. Maria Gaeta
10	Ireland	SEAI	Mr. Brian � GALLACH�IR, Chair	Yes	
11	Japan	IEEJ	Mr. Yuhji MATSUO	Yes	Mr. Brian � GALLACH�IR
12	Kazakhstan	NURIS	Mr. Yerbol AKHMETBEKOV	No	
13	Korea	KEA	Ms. HoChul Shin	Yes	Mr. Sangsoo Ahn
14	Netherlands	ECN	Mr. Bob van der ZWAAN	Yes	Mr. Francesco Dalla Longa
15	Norway	IFE	Ms. Kari Aamodt ESPEGREN	Yes	
16	Spain	CIEMAT	Ms.	No	
17	Sweden	STEM	Ms. Josefin THORESSON	Yes	Ms. Anna Krook-Riekkola
18	Switzerland	PSI	Ms. Anne-Kathrin FAUST	Yes	Mr. Tom Kober
19	UK	BEIS	Mr. Alec WATERHOUSE	Yes	Mr. Paul Dodds
20	US	DOE	Mr. Ian Mead	Yes	Mr. David Daniels
21	Sponsor	ENEL Foundation	Mr. Carlo PAPA	Yes	Mr. Claudio Pregagnoli
22	Sponsor	GE Global Research	Mr. Donald W WHISENHUNT Jr	No	

OFFICERS

Mr. George Giannkidis	ETSAP Project Head	Mr. Gary Goldstein	ETSAP Liaison Officer
-----------------------	--------------------	--------------------	-----------------------

GUESTS

Mr. Uwe Remme	IEA - Skype	Mr. Amit Kanudia	KANORS, India
Mr. Maurizio Gargiulo	E4SMA, Italy	Mr. Steffen Dockweiler	DEA, Denmark
Mr. James Price	UCL, UK	Mr. Brian Denvir	SEAI, Ireland
Mr. Torgeir Ericson	NVE, Norway	Mr. Asbj�rn Hegelund	DEA, Denmark
Mr. James Glynn	UCC, Ireland	Mr. Alexandre Koberle	UCL, UK
Mr. Raffaele Troise	ENEL, Italy	Mr. Daniel Scamman	UCL, UK
Mr. Koji Tokimatsu	TIT, Japan		

AGENDA AS OF 8 NOVEMBER 2018

No.	ITEM	DOCS
1	QUORUM COUNT	
2	ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA	
3	FOR ADOPTION	
3.1	<i>Minutes of the 74th Executive Committee + Action list</i>	K1
4	IEA-ETSAP IMPLEMENTING AGREEMENT	
4.1	Communication from the Secretariat	K2, K3
4.2	<i>ETSAP Participation and Outreach activities (web page)</i>	
4.3	<i>Development of ETSAP's tools</i>	
5	ANNEX XIV (2017-2019): UNDERSTANDING AND FACILITATING THE ENERGY TRANSITION TO ACHIEVE THE 'WELL BELOW 2°C' GOAL	
5.1	Progress of current projects and ETSAP tools	K4
5.2	<i>Annex XIV Budget report approval and general status from OA</i>	K5
5.3	<i>Final report of Annex XIV</i>	
6	ANNEX XV (2020-2022): TITLE?	
6.1	<i>Initial discussion of work program</i>	
7	OTHER BUSINESS	
7.1	<i>Election of a Chairperson and Vice-Chairpersons</i>	
7.2	<i>Next workshop and ExCo meeting: Winter 2019, New Castle, Australia.</i>	
7.3	<i>Successive meetings: Summer meeting 2020 together with IEW 2020? Winter 2020, offer from Norway.</i>	
7.4	<i>Others - Letter from Sweden, Opening TIMES</i>	
ATTACHMENTS		
K1	<i>Minutes of the 74th ExCo meeting, held in Stuttgart Thursday, November 8, 2018.</i>	
K2	<i>Action list from 74th ExCo meeting</i>	
K3	<i>Communication from the Secretariat</i>	
K4	<i>Progress of projects and tools</i>	
K5	<i>Budget report 2018</i>	

1. QUORUM COUNT

18 ETSAP participant were represented at the meeting. A quorum was reached.

2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

Two items were added under Any Other Business,

- i. Letter from Sweden
- ii. Opening up of TIMES

The ExCo adopted the amended Agenda

3. FOR ADOPTION

3.1 Minutes of the 74th Executive Committee

K1, K2

The ExCo adopted the minutes of the 74th Executive Committee meeting.

The ExCo requested that going forward, the Action list should form part of the minutes rather than a separate document.

The ExCo further requested that the update on actions from the previous meeting be added to the discussion point on previous meeting minutes.

Action List from 74 th ExCo Meeting	Progress
The ExCo minutes should be distributed within one month from the meeting.	Kenneth / Brian
ETSAP will participate in the 2019 Asian modelling workshop in Singapore subject to it being low cost.	Asian workshop on hold. ExCo agreed to focus on encouraging participation in Australia workshop instead.
ETSAP will contact TIMES model users prior to the 2019 Asian modelling workshop in Singapore	George / Gary
The ETSAP presentation and flyer will be distributed to the ExCo with the minutes.	Distributed by George.
The flyer will be available on the web-site.	https://www.iea.org/tcp/etsap/ETSAPTCPbrochureFINAL.pdf
All three will be put on the Sharepoint	Done
ETSAP will setup a meeting of the NDC working group and bring back some insights to the next ExCo.	NDC activity to be shown on ETSAP website. VITO to contact with World Bank to explore collaboration options.
ETSAP will generate and provide a template to track progress of funded projects.	Template available on sharepoint.
Each funded project should submit to DTU a report in March and September	Ongoing
ETSAP will include research reports with the ExCo minutes	Attached to minutes.

ETSAP will continue with the ExCo action list	Ongoing
Next ETSAP meeting host a session on demand modelling headed by Nadia	Subject to abstracts – insufficient abstracts received.
ETSAP will feed in information to the TCP networks that can be included in the next report.	George - Done.
ETSAP Members are encouraged to check the <u>note</u> and slides on the TCP's <u>legal structure</u> , <u>Executive Committee Procedures</u> and <u>Communication Guidelines</u> .	Issued to ExCo Memembers
ETSAP need to re-engage with IEA legal team regarding transition from Implementing Agreement to Technology Collaboration Programme.	Kenneth - Ongoing
ETSAP will engage with IRENA and IEW regarding a session on grid integrations of renewables and flexibility	Brian - Done
ETSAP will introduce deadlines for registration at workshops and for abstracts – 6 weeks in advance	Kenneth - Ongoing
ETSAP will issue workshop programmes 4 weeks in advance	Kenneth - Ongoing
ETSAP will place VEDA-TIMES starter model on the ETSAP web-site.	https://iea-etsap.org/index.php/etsap-times-starter
ETSAP will continue to support ANSWER in 2018 and 2019	Process in place Ongoing
ETSAP Members will send suggestions for improvement of the web page to George before the next ETSAP.	
ETSAP will be discuss website at the next meeting	
TIMES documentation will be updated dynamically as changes are implemented.	George provided Antti access to master-documents.
Funding proposals will be circulated to ExCO at least 2 weeks before the relevant ExCo meeting.	Ongoing
ExCo agreed funding increases of 20% for Gary and Antti	In place
ExCo will use a written procedure to clarify the decision on VEDA cloud solution.	
ExCo agreed to defer funding for approved VEDA migration project to 2018-19.	Done
ExCo agreed to allocate 100k€ for funding pro-jects.	Done
Projects not funded immediately and still fulfilling the threshold will be funded according to their ranking as fees come in.	Ongoing
ExCo agreed to maintain the €20k fee for Contracting Parties and €30k fee for Sponsors	In place
Australia will host the Autumn ETSAP Workshop and ExCo. It will take place in Newcastle on December 2-6. It will include two days advanced training (Dec 2 - 3) and three days workshop (Dec 4-6) with ExCo Dec 5 afternoon.	In progress

4. IEA-ETSAP IMPLEMENTING AGREEMENT

4.1 Communication from the Secretariat K2, K3

Uwe provided an update on recent IEA activities, reports and events. In addition, the IEA Secretariat Report Q1 2019 was discussed.

4.2 ETSAP Participation and Outreach activities

ETSAP TCP has continued to **actively engage with TCPs** through inviting other TCPs to ETSAP workshops and through participation in joint activities

- Following the ETSAP invitation to the [GHG TCP](#) to a joint session on CCS at the 71st ETSAP TCP Workshop in Maryland, IEAGHG commissioned a technical report on *CCS in Energy and Climate Scenarios*. This [report](#) was undertaken by a consortium led by ETSAP modellers, was finalized and will be publically available by end of 2019.
- Following the ETSAP invitation to the [Bioenergy TCP](#) to a joint session on *bioenergy in the energy system* at the 72nd ETSAP TCP workshop in Switzerland, a number of countries have started a new Bioenergy TCP Task ([Task 44](#)) on *Flexible Bioenergy and System Integration*. ETSAP invited a representative from Bioenergy Task 44 to present at 75th ETSAP Workshop in Paris to explore how to increase ETSAP engagement in Bioenergy Task 44.
- Following the ETSAP invitation to the [Hydrogen TCP](#) to a joint session on *Power to X* at the 73rd ETSAP TCP Workshop in Sweden, the Hydrogen TCP has initiated Task 41 entitled *Data and Modelling* that includes ETSAP teams. ETSAP invited the Hydrogen TCP to host a joint workshop to coincide with the 75th ETSAP Workshop in Paris.

The ExCo discussed further ideas for wider and deeper engagement with the IEA TCP family, namely

- [Combustion](#) TCP are interested in engaging (Tom Kober will be in contact with Gilles for a meeting to explore options)
- [Wind TCP](#) has a task focusing on system integration - [Task 25](#) Design and Operation of Power Systems with Large Amounts of Wind Power.
- There may be opportunities to explore a joint technology database with other TCPs.
- Other TCPs that were proposed for engagement by ExCo Members were the
 - Storage TCP ([ECES TCP](#)),
 - Building coordination group (serves a platform for communication and personal contacts between the different TCPs dealing with buildings and forms a connection between TCPs and the IEA Secretariat)
 - Smart Grid Action Network ([ISGAN](#)) TCP
 - Clean Energy, Education and Empowerment ([C3E](#))TCP

The ExCo agreed the following actions

- Develop a contact list of TCP's for the ETSAP members, beginning with the above-mentioned TCPs

ANNEX XIV: UNDERSTANDING AND FACILITATING THE ENERGY TRANSITION
TO ACHIEVE THE 'WELL BELOW 2°C' GOAL

- Explore opportunities for developing joint annexes or tasks (building on Hydrogen TCP Task 41)
- Continue to engage with other TCPs regarding joint sessions at ETSAP workshops
- ETSAP Members to encourage TCP gatherings at national level
- Key focus should focus on collaboration with TCP's for technologies dominating TIMES results and which are most uncertain (CCS, bioenergy, variable RE, etc.)

The ExCo also discussed progress in ongoing engagements with possible ETSAP Contracting Parties.

- Regarding Canada, there has been no further feedback
- Regarding Chile, a VEDA TIMES training course will take place July 23-25 2019 in conjunction with the Ministry of Energy, Chile.
- There are ongoing engagements with Singapore, Vietnam, New Zealand and Indonesia. These range from ETSAP tool modelling activities in the countries to interest in participating in ETSAP.

The ExCo discussed possible engagement with IEA Association countries (Brazil, China, India, Indonesia, Morocco, Singapore, South Africa and Thailand). The ExCo agreed to seek to coordinate with IEA on joint training workshops etc.

The ExCo agree to focus in the short term on countries close to Australia and invite participants to the 76th ETSAP Workshop (including also Malaysia and Philippines).

Regarding existing sponsors, GE Global Research is withdrawing from ETSAP. ENEL Foundation has recommitted to continued participation within ETSAP.

The ETSAP website was discussed and the ExCo agreed that ETSAP partners should send comments to George by e-mail before the 76th ExCo meeting.

The deadline for inclusion in the IPCC AR6 report is June 2020 for submitted journal papers on national models/scenarios. One suggestion was to undertake analysis using country models with a harmonized dataset. A number of countries expressed interest in this (France, Ireland, Germany, Sweden and UK). A further suggestion was that analysis with ETSAP-TIAM could also feed into AR6.

4.3 Development of ETSAP's tools

Amit provided an update to the ExCo regarding the redevelopment of VEDA project that was approved in the 72nd ExCo meeting in Zürich.

- The new VEDA Front End prototype is ready. Several TIMES groups have helped testing. It has synced for most tested models, the next step is testing if the models can solve. Debugging is underway. The model speed for running is anticipated to increase by two to five times faster with the new setup.

- A new platform and database structure is under development. All data handling is in PostReSQL after reading the data in Excel files.
- The new VEDA Back-end prototype will be ready for next meeting
- The same group who has been testing will continue on the next steps within a month
- Amongst the advantages reported, there will be no limits to size anymore and the code easier to maintain

The 74th ExCo in Stuttgart agreed that an advanced TIMES training course would take place as part of the 76th ETSAP meeting in Australia. Amit requested that a list of problems be provided in advance. The ExCo agreed that George would e-mail a request for topics for the advanced training linking to Forum.

The ExCo agreed that the advanced training should not overlap with the ETAP workshop and basic training.

The ExCo also discussed the possibility of including advanced TIMES insights from Antti. In addition, the option of a GAMS course was considered, possibly at the summer 2020 ETSAP meeting. The ExCo agreed that this would be decided at the 76th ExCo meeting in Australia.

5. ANNEX XIV (2017-2019): UNDERSTANDING AND FACILITATING THE ENERGY TRANSITION TO ACHIEVE THE 'WELL BELOW 2°C' GOAL

5.1 Progress of current projects and ETSAP tools K4

The ExCo reviewed the progress on current projects. The ExCo suggested that the final report of the GTAP-TIMES project should be framed as a "How to" report.

5.2. Annex XIV Budget report approval and general status from OA K5

The Operating Agent presented the budget report, which was discussed and approved.

The ExCo also suggested that at future ExCo meetings that additional information be provided detailing a breakdown the spending on workshops and ETSAP tools maintenance.

The ExCo also requested that the final budget report should be circulated at least two weeks before ExCo meetings.

5.3 Final report of Annex XIV

The ExCo discussed the format for the ETSAP final report for Annex XIV, including

- web site including some power points;
- short document with links to papers (possibly a 'living' document);
- different report types for different audiences: CERT, funding Governments, TCP's, other researchers - maybe make sections fitting to each of these.
- purpose of the report could be to support continued funding

- focus could be on capacity building, collaboration, policy in-sights, big challenges that ETSAP can address
- questionnaire to find out what kind of results they are interested in
- quantification of co-published papers
- a third ETSAP book - but that will extra to the final report
- Should address the question - what would not have happened if the Annex was not there
- Uwe will check precise final report requirements from IEA/CERT

The ExCo concluded that a power point format would be best providing an overview on output, capabilities developed, impacts and outcomes, with web links to papers etc. The ExCo requested that each country provide slides.

6. ANNEX XV (2020-2022): TITLE (TO BE DETERMINED)

6.1 Initial discussion of Annex XV work program

The ExCo had an initial discussion on the focus of the work programme for the next ETSAP Annex. The ExCo agreed that a draft work programme be distributed to Contracting Parties prior to the 76th ExCo for agreement at the meeting.

- Focus on communication - policy makers, public, Multiple perspectives and objectives.
- Human behaviour, social science, humanity aspects, circular economy (metals etc.)
- Impact of R&D - investment in R&D, innovation, what can that lead to, trade-off
- Paris Agreement stocktake 2023 (James)
- What are the key SDG's ETSAP can feed into?
- Modelling uncertainty - tools
- Modelling the costs of de-carbonisation in a way that can be understood by non-modeller
- Possible ways to open source TIMES model, GIS + open data
- Include other GHG - LULUCF, farming, etc.
- Willingness to pay for the transition.
- Engagement with financial sector - how to support decisions
- NEXUS'es
- Conflict between mitigation and nature (e.g. on-shore wind etc.)
- Demand side management
- Title: "Paris Agreement stocktake 2023"?

7. OTHER BUSINESS

7.1 Election of a Chairperson and Vice-Chairpersons

Maria Rosa steps down as vice-chair. The ExCo elected Brian Ó Gallachóir as Chair and Markus Blesl and Tiina Koljonen as Vice-Chairs.

7.2 Next workshop and ExCo meeting: Winter 2019, New Castle, Australia.

The ExCo finalised the dates for the 76th ETSAP meeting as follows.

- 76th ETSAP Workshop from 9-11 December
- 76th ETSAP ExCo Dec 10 (afternoon)
- Basic training from 9-11 December
- Advanced training from 12-13 December

7.3 Successive meetings:

The ExCo decided that the 77th ETSAP meeting (summer 2020) would take place together with IEW 2020 June 29 - July 1 in Freiburg, Germany. The 77th ETSAP meeting will be July 2-3 and 77th ExCo will take place on July 2 in the afternoon

The ExCo requested offers for the 78th meeting (Winter 2020) and received an offer from Norway. The final decision will be taken during the 76th ExCo in Australia.

7.4 Any Other Business

i) Letter from Sweden. The ETSAP Management received a letter from Sweden expressing concern regarding timing of information regarding financial decisions being made at ExCo meetings and gender equality.

The ExCo discussed these two topics and agreed the following

- ETSAP will strive to have all financial decisions for meetings included in the agenda issued at latest one month before each ExCo
- If an issue arises during the ExCo requiring a financial decision that was not in the agenda, the ExCo can allocate up to a maximum of €10k during the meeting. If the decision involves a financial allocation of greater than €10k, this will be decided by email voting procedure after the meeting.
- The ExCo acknowledges the concerns raised about gender representation within ETSAP and how gender is treated in our modelling tools.
- The ExCo requested that the ETSAP management engage with the C3E TCP and explore how to include gender analysis in scenario analysis.
- In addition, the ETSAP Chair will send a letter to the Swedish Energy Agency in response.

ii) Opening up TIMES?

The ExCo discussed opening up TIMES against the context of increasing number of funding calls and Government Agencies requesting open source models. There were different views expressed on what 'open' means, e.g.

- does open source mean free, transparent code or accessible?
- what is included in opening - TIMES, data-handling, data?

The ExCo agreed that the ETSAP management should look into licensing and consider including in the next work program.

The TIMES starter model was also discussed in the context of opening up TIMES. There was some discussion on possible training on the starter model. The ExCo agreed that the NDC group should meet and discuss this and provide input on this.

8. AGREED ACTIONS

Action List from 75 th ExCo Meeting	Owner
The Action list should form part of the minutes rather than a separate document.	Kenneth / Brian
Add the update on actions from the previous meeting to the discussion point on previous meeting minutes.	Kenneth / Brian
Contact World Bank to explore NDC collaboration options.	VITO
Develop a contact list of TCP's for the ETSAP members, beginning with identified TCPs	George / Kenneth
Explore opportunities for developing joint annexes or tasks (building on Hydrogen TCP Task 41	George / Kenneth
Engage with Combustion TCP and Wind TCP (Task 25)	Tom Kober and Brian
ETSAP Members to encourage TCP gatherings at national level	ETSAP teams
Seek to coordinate with IEA on joint training workshops for IEA Association Countries	George / Uwe
Focus in the short term on countries close to Australia and invite participants to the 76th ETSAP Workshop (including also Malaysia and Philippines).	George / Kenneth / Luke
ETSAP partners should send comments on website to George by e-mail before the 76th ExCo meeting.	ETSAP teams
Submit journal papers on national models/scenarios for inclusion in the IPCC AR6 report by June 2020	ETSAP teams
New VEDA Back-end prototype will be ready for 76 th meeting	Amit
Topics for advanced training will be requested E-mail.	George
Topics for the advanced training will be provided via the Forum	ETSAP teams
Advanced training should not overlap with the ETSAP workshop and basic training	George / Amit / Maurizio
Decision required on possible GAMS course at the summer 2020 77 th ETSAP meeting	ExCo
ExCo suggested that final report of the GTAP-TIMES project should be framed as a "How to" report	Project team

ANNEX XIV: UNDERSTANDING AND FACILITATING THE ENERGY TRANSITION
TO ACHIEVE THE 'WELL BELOW 2°C' GOAL

Provide additional information in financial report detailing a breakdown the spending on workshops and ETSAP tools maintenance	Kenneth
final budget report should be circulated at least two weeks before ExCo meetings	Kenneth
Annex XIV should be prepared in power point format providing and overview on output, capabilities developed, impacts and outcomes, with web links to papers etc..	George
The ExCo requested that each country provide slides for final report	ETSAP teams
Draft Annex XV work programme to be distributed to Contracting Parties prior to the 76th ExCo for agreement at the meeting	Brian / George / Kenneth
Dates agreed for 76th ETSAP Workshop 9-11 December, 76th ETSAP ExCo Dec 10 (afternoon), Basic training from 9-11 December and advanced training from 12-13 December	Kenneth / Luke / Maurizio / Amit
Dates agreed for 77th ETSAP meeting (summer 2020) with IEW 2020 June 29 – July 1 in Freiburg, Germany.	Kenneth
The 77th ETSAP meeting will be July 2-3 and 77th ExCo will take place on July 2 in the afternoon	Kenneth
Final decision on 78 th ETSAP meeting will be taken during the 76th ExCo in Australia	ExCo
ETSAP will strive to have all financial decisions for meetings included in the agenda issued at latest one month before each ExCo	Kenneth
If an issue arises during the ExCo requiring a financial decision that was not in the agenda, the ExCo can allocate up to a maximum of €10k during the meeting. If the decision involves a financial allocation of greater than €10k, this will be decided by email voting procedure after the meeting.	ExCo
ETSAP management engage with the C3E TCP and explore how to include gender analysis in scenario analysis.	George
ETSAP Chair will send a letter to the Swedish Energy Agency in response to their letter of May 23 2019.	Brian
ETSAP management will look into licensing and consider including in the next work program.	George / Kenneth / Brian
NDC group should meet and discuss TIMES Starter training	George