

ANNEX XIV: UNDERSTANDING AND FACILITATING THE ENERGY TRANSITION TO ACHIEVE THE
'WELL BELOW 2°C' GOAL

74TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

Date: Thursday, November 8, 2018 (14.00 - 18.00)
IER Stuttgart University, Germany
Venue: campus.guest, Universitätsstraße 34, 70569 Stuttgart, Room 168 &169
Contacts: Kenneth Karlsson, [keka@etsap.org].

MINUTES OF THE 74TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

Held on Thursday, November 8, (14.00 - 18.00), 2018, at IER Stuttgart University, Germany

TABLE 1: PARTICIPANTS

N.	Country	Participant	Delegate	Attended	Stand-ins
1	Australia	CSIRO	Mr. Luke REEDMAN	Yes	
2	Belgium	VITO/SPW/Brussels	Mr. Jan DUERINCK	Yes	
			??		
3	Denmark	DEA	Mr. Aksel Laurids BECK	Yes	Mr. Kenneth Karlsson, OA
4	EC	JRC Directorate	Mr. Wouter Nijs	Yes	On Skype
5	Finland	VTT/TEKES	Ms. Pia SALOKOSKI	Yes	Mr. Antti Lehtilä
6	France	ADEME/EDMP/ DGEMPEDAD	Mr. Emmanuel Combet	Yes	Ms. Nadia Maizi
7	Germany	IER	Mr. Markus BLESLE, Vice chair	Yes	
8	Greece	CRES	Mr. Philip Siakkis	Yes	Mr. George Giannakidis
9	Italy	ENEA	Ms. Maria Rosa VIRDIS, Vice Chair	No	
10	Ireland	SEAI	Mr. Brian Ó GALLACHÓIR, Chair	Yes	
11	Japan	IEEJ	Mr. Yuhji MATSUO	Yes	Mr. Brian Ó GALLACHÓIR
12	Kazakhstan	NURIS	Mr. Yerbol AKHMETBEKOV	No	
13	Korea	KEA	Ms. HoChul Shin	Yes	
14	Netherlands	ECN	Mr. Bob van der ZWAAN	No	
15	Norway	IFE	Ms. Kari Aamodt ESPEGREN	Yes	
16	Spain	CIEMAT	Ms. Helena CABAL	Yes	Ms. Kari Aamodt ESPEGREN
17	Sweden	STEM	Ms. Josefin THORESSON	Yes	Ms. Anna Krook-Riekkola
18	Switzerland	PSI	Ms. Anne-Kathrin FAUST	Yes	Mr. Tom Kober
19	UK	DECC	Mr. Alec WATERHOUSE	Yes	Ms. Tamaryn Napp
20	US	DOE	Mr. Ian Mead	Yes	
21	Sponsor	ENEL Foundation	Mr. Carlo PAPA	No	
22	Sponsor	GE Global Research	Mr. Donald W WHISENHUNT Jr	No	

Officers: Mr. Gary Goldstein ETSAP, Liaison Officer, GAMS, MARKAL, DWI by Skype

Guests:

Mr. Uwe Remme	IEA - Skype	Mr. Jens Winkler	Germany
Ms. Kathleen Vailloncourt	ESMIA consultant	Mr. Christoph Jessen	Germany
Mr. Russell McKenna	DTU, Denmark	XXX	
Mr. Paul Mc ???	UCL, UK	XXX	

ANNEX XIV: UNDERSTANDING AND FACILITATING THE ENERGY TRANSITION TO ACHIEVE THE
'WELL BELOW 2°C' GOAL

AGENDA AS OF 8 NOVEMBER 2018

No.	ITEM	DOCS
1	QUORUM COUNT	
2	ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA	
3	FOR THE RECORD	
3.1	<i>Minutes of the 73rd Executive Committee</i>	J1
3.2	<i>Progress on actions agreed</i>	J2
4	IEA-ETSAP IMPLEMENTING AGREEMENT	
4.1	<i>Communication from the Secretariat</i>	J3
4.2	<i>ETSAP Participation and Outreach activities</i>	
4.3	<i>Development of ETSAP's tools</i>	
4.4	<i>ETSAP website - what is new?</i>	
5	ANNEX XIV (2017-2019): UNDERSTANDING AND FACILITATING THE ENERGY TRANSITION TO ACHIEVE THE 'WELL BELOW 2°C' GOAL	
5.1	<i>Progress of current projects and ETSAP tools</i>	J4
5.2	<i>Annex XIV Budget and cash flow report</i>	J5
5.3	<i>Confirmation of participation fee 2019</i>	
5.4	<i>Selections of projects</i>	J6
6	OTHER BUSINESS	
6.1	<i>Next workshop and ExCo meeting: Summer 2019, IEA, Paris - together with IEW2019.</i>	
6.2	<i>Successive meetings: Winther meeting 2019, Australia. Summer 2020? TBD</i>	
6.3	<i>Others</i>	
<hr/>		
	ATTACHMENTS	
J1	<i>Minutes of the 73rd ExCo meeting, held in Gothenburg Monday, June 18, 2018</i>	
J2	<i>Progress on actions agreed</i>	
J3	<i>Communication from the Secretariat</i>	
J4	<i>Progress of projects and tools</i>	
J5	<i>Budget report 2018</i>	
J6	<i>Project proposals</i>	

1. QUORUM COUNT

The chair asked everyone representing a country to identify themselves by name and by country.

ETSAP has twenty-two Participants comprising twenty Contracting Parties (CP) and two Sponsors. The quorum is one-half of the members plus one, i.e. twelve.

ANNEX XIV: UNDERSTANDING AND FACILITATING THE ENERGY TRANSITION TO ACHIEVE THE 'WELL BELOW 2°C' GOAL

There were 17 Participants present in total, 7 delegates attended in person and 10 participated through their stand-ins (see above, Table 1). A quorum was achieved.

2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

The Chair presented the agenda for the Executive Committee (ExCo) meeting. A draft agenda had been circulated prior to the meeting. Suggestions for Any Other Business were requested. The following additional points were proposed:

- Suggestions for the ExCo from the modelling teams arising from the Workshop
- Add an item under 4.3, namely possible joint activity / workshop and future collaboration with IRENA on Renewables integration and system flexibility
- ETSAP community input into IPCC (Nadia has been appointed IPCC author focussing on demand)
- TIMES modelling Cloud proposal discussion

The agenda including the suggestion was adopted.

3. FOR THE RECORD

3.1 Minutes of the 73rd Executive Committee J1

There were no comments to the finalised minutes. The ExCo agreed with the proposal that the minutes should be distributed within one month of the meeting.

3.2 Progress on actions agreed J2

The Chair outlined the progress on the list of actions agreed at the 73rd ExCo meeting- see attachment J2

Regarding ETSAP Training and participation in the [5th Asian Energy Modelling Workshop](#), September 2018, the feedback from those who participated was positive, with good involvement also from students. It was felt that a longer session could make it possible to share insights from both sides and that we should be more pro-active in contacting the TIMES users before the meeting.

The chair proposed that we engage again next year if it can be low/no cost for ETSAP - this suggestion was agreed by the ExCo. George, Mauri and Gary will act as the contact points.

The *Intro to ETSAP* presentation and flyer will be distributed to the ExCo with the minutes. The flyer will be available on the web-site. All three will be put on the Sharepoint

Regarding the ETSAP working group National Determined Contributions, the ExCo discussed how to collaborate and with whom, against a context where ETSAP members are competing for projects and it's still unclear how to position ETSAP in this activity in relation to other competing modelling types. The ExCo agreed that the ETSAP NDC working group should meet again and agree suggestions on how ETSAP can feed into the NDC's.

The ExCo agreed to continue with the action list for future ExCo meetings

ANNEX XIV: UNDERSTANDING AND FACILITATING THE ENERGY TRANSITION TO ACHIEVE THE
'WELL BELOW 2°C' GOAL

4. IEA-ETSAP IMPLEMENTING AGREEMENT

4.1 Communication from the Secretariat

J3

The 3rd Quarter IEA Secretariat report was presented and discussed. The purpose of these reports are to provide an overview of recent developments within the Energy Technology Network (ETN) and the IEA Secretariat that are of interest to all Technology Collaboration Programmes (TCPs). The ExCo agreed that ETSAP should feed information into the TCP networks and hoped that the recent ETSAP input will be included in the next IEA Secretariat report.

The ExCo further agreed that ETSAP should check the recent changes in TCP communications guidance and to re-engage with IEA Secretariat lawyers regarding changes from Implementing Agreement to Technology Collaboration Programmes.

4.2 ETSAP Participation and Outreach activities

Our attempts to reengage with Canada continue but no progress - ExCo agreed that the modelling teams be encouraged in Canada to continue trying to progress this.

Regarding our current sponsors, ENEL Foundation and GE Global Research, ETSAP has attempted to reengage them but very little response to date. ExCo agreed for George to make contact again.

ETSAP ExCo Chair delivered a presentation on *Bridging the gap between National and Local Energy Planning* at the [G-STIC 2018](#) Conference, Nov 28-30 Brussels.

As agreed at the 73rd ExCo, ETSAP has joined the IRENA Clean Energy Ministerial Campaign on Long Term Energy Scenarios as a partner. As part of this activity, there will be a

- joint IRENA ETSAP workshop on Nov 9 on Innovation in Energy Systems Modelling
- Uwe, Tiina, George and Brian will deliver IRENA webinars on energy systems modelling activities in Nov 29, Dec 13 and January 17.

The ExCo further agreed to engage with IEW on a session on flexibility - this could be a 2 hour session in the programme or an IEW side-event. ExCo encouraged members to submit abstracts to IEW on this topic.

ExCo agreed that a template will be developed and provided for tracking progress of ETSAP funded projects. ExCo further agreed that each project should submit a report using this template in March and September.

The webinar on advanced training was a great success. There is an appetite for more. George will look into how best to proceed.

Regarding previous discussions on reducing costs for new users, ETSAP can setup a server platform and make TIMES available on a pay per use basis. It would also be possible to give new users free access. If ETSAP pays €16k, then 10 different user at the time can use VEDA-TIMES, but more models can be also stored in the cloud. ExCo agreed to delay a decision until the project proposals were evaluated and approved.

ANNEX XIV: UNDERSTANDING AND FACILITATING THE ENERGY TRANSITION TO ACHIEVE THE 'WELL BELOW 2°C' GOAL

ExCo agreed that further notice should be given to prospective participants regarding ETSAP Workshop structure and content. This requires earlier submission of abstracts. It was further agreed that the mix of session with presentations and with discussions (as initiated in Stuttgart) was a good way forward. ExCo decided to introduce deadlines for registration and abstracts - 6 weeks in advance and issue program 4 weeks in advance.

4.3 Development of ETSAP's tools

Gary - VEDA-TIMES starter model. ExCo agreed it should be put on the web-site. OA will contact Gary on where it should be placed on the web.

ANSWER starter model should be downloadable from and automatic form on the homepage. Information on name, institution etc. when downloading.

In response to positive feedback from ANSWER users, ExCo agreed to continue funding support of ANSWER to 2018 and 2019.

4.4 ETSAP website - what is new?

ExCo agreed ETSAP should consider on-line info graphics and an updated list of publications on the web-site.

Concerns were raised about some aspects of the website and ExCo agreed that suggestions for improvement of the web page should be sent to George before the next ETSAP meeting for discussion.

5. ANNEX XIV (2017-2019): UNDERSTANDING AND FACILITATING THE ENERGY TRANSITION TO ACHIEVE THE 'WELL BELOW 2°C' GOAL

5.1 Progress of current projects and ETSAP tools J4

Attachment J4 provides an update on the projects funded by ETSAP

- "RC-Enhancing the representation of flexibility in TIMES: Introducing Ancillary Services Markets", Panos Evangelos - just signed
- RC - TIMES-GTAP soft-link methodology and interface, Brian O Gallachoir (mail 11-10-17)
- RC - Addressing Uncertainty in TIMES Using Monte Carlo Analysis Tom Kober, PSI
- RC - ETSAP TIAM part 1 and 2, Kenneth Karlsson, DTU

Antti indicated that TIMES online documentation could be updated dynamically as new things has been implemented. ExCo agreed to pursue this, that George provide access to the master-documents, and that the budget for Antti's contribution to ETSAP be increased by 20% to fund this.

5.2. Annex XIV Budget and cash flow report J5

ANNEX XIV: UNDERSTANDING AND FACILITATING THE ENERGY TRANSITION TO ACHIEVE THE 'WELL BELOW 2°C' GOAL

The meeting was informed that Italy has not paid since 2016. George will engage with Italy but in the meantime, as per agreed procedures, Italy cannot receive research funds from ETSAP and free access to tools. The question of vice-chair (currently from Italy) will be treated on the next meeting.

ExCo agreed that proposals for funding should be circulated at least 2 weeks before the meeting.

ExCo further agreed to increase the budgets ETSAP support by 20% for Gary Goldstein and Antti Lehtilä to reflect increased workloads.

It was further agreed by ExCo that a written procedure will be used to decide on the VEDA cloud option discussed earlier.

ExCo decided to defer VEDA migration funding from 2017-2018 to 2018-19.

Based on the available anticipated funding, ExCo agreed to allocate €180k for funding projects. In line with agreed procedures, ranked projects up to current cash available will be funded and projects not funded immediately but still within the €180k budget limit will be funded as fees come in according to their ranking.

5.3 Confirmation of participation fee for 2019

ExCo confirmed to maintain the 20k€ fee for member countries and 30k€ fee for sponsors.

5.4 Selections of projects

J6

Project number 6 was distributed late. A number of members expressed concern but the ExCo accepted to include it in the ranking.

The ExCo members voted on the project proposals. The outcome of this process was that

- Project 5 *Excel technology database for energy system models integrated with a TIMES* will be funded now with a budget of €82k
- Project 3 *Modelling of hydrogen & Joint workshops with Hydrogen TCP* with a budget of €39.3k will be funded when sufficient fees arrive
- Project 4 *Summer School on Prospective Modelling and Energy Transitions using TIMES (SPETT)* with a budget of €36.8k will be funded when sufficient fees arrive.

6. OTHER BUSINESS

6.1 Next workshop and ExCo meeting: Summer 2019, IEA, Paris - together with IEW2019

The ExCo will inform members when the IEW 2019 and the ETSAP Paris meeting dates are agreed.

ANNEX XIV: UNDERSTANDING AND FACILITATING THE ENERGY TRANSITION TO ACHIEVE THE 'WELL BELOW 2°C' GOAL

Nadia informed the meeting that she is an IPCC author on Chapter 5 of the WG3 report. She indicated a survey is underway on ongoing work on demand side modelling. Following the IPCC Meeting in April 2019 they will have 2 years to prepare the chapter. The ExCo agreed that the next ETSAP meeting will include a session on demand modelling headed by Nadia. OA will send out the request for input based on mail from Nadia.

6.2 Successive meetings: Winter meeting 2019, Australia. Summer 2020? TBD

The ExCo agreed that the winter meeting 2019 will take place in Newcastle, Australia on the week starting 2 December are decided. It will comprise two days advanced training (Dec 2-3) followed by 3 days of workshop sessions (Dec 4-6) with ExCo Thursday (Dec 5).

Winter 2020 - offer from Norway.

6.3 Others

IRENA proposed a collaboration with ETSAP on infrastructure and flexibility as part of our collaboration on CEM LTES campaign. The ExCo agreed and Brian will follow up

One option is a focussed session on this topic at the next ETSAP workshop exploring how can the ETSAP community feed into these challenges?

The ExCo discussed the open facilitated discussion session during the workshop on improving ETSAP support to users (see Google doc and PDF version from James). This experiment in brainstorming on these topics using group work met with very positive feed-back.

The experiment was a success and the ExCo agreed we will use it to engage with the modelling teams. Options discussed included one theme can be picked for discussion and a voting app used, the themes can be sent out before the meeting so participants can prepare. The ExCo did highlight the in translating these ideas into actual actions.