

ETSAP - ENERGY TECHNOLOGY SYSTEMS ANALYSIS PROGRAMME
Implementing Agreement of the INTERNATIONAL ENERGY AGENCY - IEA/AIE

MINUTES OF THE 69TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

*held on Monday, May 30, (14.00 - 18.00), 2016, at the
University College Cork, Ireland.*

TABLE 1: PARTICIPANTS

N.	Country	Contracting Party	Delegate	Attended	Stand-ins
1	Belgium	VITO/SPW/Brussels	Mr. Jan DUERINCK	Yes	Ms Nathalie Arnould
2	Denmark	DEA	Mr. Aksel Laurids BECK	Yes	Mr. Kenneth Karlsson
3	EC	JRC Directorate	Mr. Andreas Zucker	Yes	Mr. Wouter Nijs
4	Finland	VTT/TEKES	Ms. Pia SALOKOSKI	Yes	Ms. Tiina Koljonen
5	France	ADEME/EDMP/ DGEMPEAD	Ms. Nadia MAIZI	Yes	Ms. Sandrine Seloisse
6	Germany	IER	Mr. Markus BLESL, Vice chair	Yes	
7	Greece	CRES	Mr. George GIANNAKIDIS, OA	Yes	
8	Italy	ENEA	Ms. Maria Rosa VIRDIS, Vice Chair	Yes	
9	Ireland	SEAI	Mr. Brian Ó GALLACHÓIR, Chair	Yes	
10	Japan	IEEJ	Mr Yuhji Matsuo	Yes	Mr Yuhji Matsuo
11	Kazakhstan	NURIS	Mr. Yerbol AKHMETBEKOV	Yes	Mr. Bakytzhan Suleimenov
12	Korea	KEA	Mr. HoChul Shin	Yes	
13	Netherlands	ECN	Mr. Bob van der Zwaan	Yes	Mr. Tom Kober
14	Norway	IFE	Ms. Kari Aamodt ESPEGREN	Yes	
15	Russian Fed.	ERI-RAS	Mr. Sergey FILIPPOV	No	
16	Spain	CIEMAT	Ms. Helena CABAL	Yes	
17	Sweden	STEM	Mr. Andreas Bjorke	Yes	Mr. Erik Ahlgren
18	Switzerland	PSI	Ms. Anne-Kathrin Faust	Yes	Ms. Tom Kober
19	UK	DECC	Mr. Alec Waterhouse	Yes	Mr. Neil Strachan
20	US	DOE	Mr. Carmine DI FIGLIO	No	
21	Sponsor	ENEL Foundation	Mr. Carlo PAPA	No	

Officers:

Mr. Giancarlo Tosato	Project Head
Mr. Uwe Remme	IEA Secretariat
Mr. Gary Goldstein	ETSAP, Liaison Officer, GAMS, MARKAL, DWI
Mr. Ken Noble	NobleSoft
Mr. Amit Kanudia	KanORS

Guests:

Mr. Luke Reedman	CSIRO, Australia	Mr. Pieter Lodewijks	VITO, Belgium
Mr. Antonio Rodriguez	UAEM, Mexico	Mr. Bob Hanna	DCENR, Ireland
Ms. Carol Lenox	EPA, USA	Mr. Maurizio Gargiulo	E4SMA, Italy
Mr. Trevor Kirsten	GE Global Research	Mr. Kris Poncelet	KU Leuven, Belgium

ANNEX XIII: TOOLS FOR ANALYSIS OF A FUTURE ENERGY REVOLUTION

TABLE 2: AGENDA

No.	ITEM	DOCS
1	QUORUM COUNT	
2	ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA	
3	FOR THE RECORD	
3.1	<i>Minutes of the 68th Executive Committee</i>	E1
4	IEA-ETSAP IMPLEMENTING AGREEMENT	
	<i>Communication from the Secretariat</i>	
4.1	<i>Possible collaboration of ETSAP and ETP/IEA on technology innovation</i>	E2
4.2	<i>ETSAP Participation</i>	
4.3	<i>Annex XIV Work programme, Operating Agent and Project Head</i>	E3
4.4	<i>ETSAP's tools future development</i>	E4
5	ANNEX XIII (2014-2016): TOOLS FOR ANALYSIS OF A FUTURE ENERGY REVOLUTION	
5.1	<i>Progress of current projects and ETSAP tools</i>	E5
5.2	<i>Annex XIII 2015 Budget Report</i>	E6
6	OTHER BUSINESS	
6.1	<i>Election of a Chairperson</i>	
6.2	<i>Next workshop and ExCo meeting: Madrid, Spain.</i>	
6.3	<i>Successive meetings: Together with IEW 2017.</i>	
6.4	<i>Others.</i>	
ATTACHMENTS		
E1	<i>Minutes of the 68th ExCo meeting, held in Sophia Antipolis Thursday, October 22, 2015.</i>	
E2	<i>Communication from the Secretariat.</i>	
E3	<i>Annex XIV Work programme, Operating Agent and Project Head.</i>	
E4	<i>ETSAP's tools future development.</i>	
E5	<i>Progress of current projects and ETSAP tools.</i>	
E6	<i>Annex XIII Budget report for 2015.</i>	

ANNEX XIII: TOOLS FOR ANALYSIS OF A FUTURE ENERGY REVOLUTION

Opening

The Chair, Mr. Brian Ó Gallachóir, opened the meeting at 14:00 welcoming the delegates and guests to UCC and to Cork. A tour de table followed.

1. Quorum Count

ETSAP has twenty one Contracting Parties (CP), the quorum is eleven. Nine delegates attended in person and nine CPs through their stand-ins (see above, Table 1). A quorum was present.

2. Adoption of the agenda

The Chair presented the agenda of the Executive Committee (ExCo) meeting. The following topics were added under the *Other business*: Mr. Nijs added a question on the IPRs of model generators; Mr. Kober added a topic on shifting the project for “Integrated Water Modelling in TIMES - Moving towards best practice” approved in the 68th ExCo from ECN to PSI; Ms Espegren added two points that were mentioned in the minutes of the previous ExCo and should be discussed now: how other TCPs determine the fees and the update of the ranking method for funding project proposals; the Chair added a proposal for setting up a fund under Giancarlo Tosato’s name for covering the expenses of trainees from less developed countries to attend ETSAP’s training courses. The agenda with these additions was adopted by the delegates.

3. For the record

3.1 Minutes of the 68th Executive Committee - for the record (*Attachment E1*)

The minutes of the 68th Executive Committee meeting (on October 22nd 2015 in Sophia Antipolis) were distributed to the CPs after that meeting, no comments were received and the final version was adopted in December 2015.

4. IEA-ETSAP Implementing Agreement

4.1 Communication from the Secretariat (*Attachment E2*)

Mr Remme presented the main points of the communication from the IEA Secretariat (see *Attachment E2* for details). The re-branding of the Implementing Agreements as Technological Cooperation Programmes (TCPs) was one of the highlights of last year and focus for the increase of communication between TCPs and the IEA. ETSAP will have to submit an annual report to the CERT about the activities of each year. After the Paris agreement there is a window for collaboration between ETSAP and IEA with the application of the Global TIAM model with a focus on the sectoral allocation of GHG emissions reduction targets. The “Mission Innovation” initiative launched at the Paris COP could also be an area of collaboration for Global models with a focus on technology learning in ETSAP’s tools. Dr. Strachan mentioned that IPCC is due to report by September 2017 for the scenarios of well below 2°C, therefore any work done by ETSAP on the topic should be published by January/February 2017 in order to be considered by IPCC. The Secretariat will circulate and email on the possible collaboration among CPs in order to coordinate the actions.

4.2 Participation in ETSAP

The Executive Committee unanimously invited South Africa to join ETSAP after an expression of interest from SANEDI. Ukraine was invited last year to join ETSAP but due to a change of Minister there is no progress yet. Japan has re-engaged its participation in ETSAP and is participating actively from 2016. US-EPA is actively using ETSAP’s tools

ANNEX XIII: TOOLS FOR ANALYSIS OF A FUTURE ENERGY REVOLUTION

(MARKAL and now migrating to TIMES) and expressed an interest to engage in ETSAP. Australia is finalising the process of signing the TCP text within 2016.

The Chair informed the delegates that GE Global Research expressed an interest to participate as a sponsor in ETSAP. The Chair invited Dr Trevor Kirsten from the Disruptive Energy Laboratory of GE Research to present to the delegates on the activities, interest in ETSAP tools and in contributing to and participation in ETSAP.

After discussion the Executive Committee unanimously resolved to invite GE Research to join the Energy Technology Systems Analysis Program Technology Cooperation Programme as a Sponsor.

The Executive Committee further resolved by unanimity:

a) to invite GE Global Research to join the Energy Technology Systems Analysis Program Technology Cooperation Programme on the following terms:

- (i) GE Global Research will have equal obligations to, but no greater rights or benefits than Contracting Parties from OECD non-member countries.
- (ii) In accordance with the Framework, no representative of GE Global Research will be able to be Chair or Vice-Chair of the Executive Committee.
- (iii) GE Global Research will pay an annual fee of €30,000 with an interest to continue the collaboration in the following Annexes. If GE Global Research does not pay the annual fee, the license of the ETSAP tools provided will be invalidated and GE Global Research will not be able to use the tools.
- (iv) The participation by the Sponsor will be for three years, renewable annually with an exchange of letters.
- (v) GE Global Research will have a full single vote in the Executive Committee, equal to that of a Contracting Party on matters pertaining to the Programme of Work of ETSAP. This will enable GE Global Research to make proposals for the work programme, participate in the voting on all topics excepting those items defined in item (vi) below.
- (vi) No representative of GE Global Research will be able to vote on the accession of new Sponsors or Contracting Parties or on the ejection of existing Sponsors or Contracting Parties.
GE Global Research cannot block an otherwise unanimous vote.
- (vii) Articles [1-11], excluding Art. 9a of the Implementing Agreement text apply equally to GE Global Research as to Contracting Parties
- (viii) If GE Global Research decides to withdraw from ETSAP, GE Global Research should not use the ETSAP-TIAM global multi-regional model.

b) that the ExCo Chair will expedite the formal procedures of membership on behalf of the Executive Committee.

The ExCo encourages the active involvement of GE in ETSAP and the exchange of knowledge and experience that is happening within the workshops.

4.3 Annex XIV Work programme, Operating Agent and Project Head (*Attachment E3*)

The Chair informed the delegates that CRES cannot be the Operating Agent after 2016 due to the associated heavy administrative processes within CRES, and that Mr Giancarlo Tosato acting as project head, will retire at the end of 2016. The Chair received one proposal from Dr Kenneth Karlsson and DTU to act as the Operating Agent and one proposal from Dr. George Giannakidis to act as the project head, starting in January 2017.

ANNEX XIII: TOOLS FOR ANALYSIS OF A FUTURE ENERGY REVOLUTION

The Executive Committee unanimously decided to appoint Dr Kenneth Karlsson and DTU to act as the Operating Agent and Dr. George Giannakidis to act as the project head starting 1st January 2017.

The Chair presented the proposed text of Annex XIV. The delegates discussed the content and decided to: change the title to “Understanding and facilitating the energy transition to achieve the “well below 2°C” goal”; include in the objective of capacity building a focus on engaging organisations in developing countries and emerging economies; include as an objective the engagement with the decision makers, IEA secretariat and the other TCPs for a deeper collaboration; add a more detailed description of the activities of the project head. After these amendments the delegates approved in unanimity the work-programme for Annex XIV.

4.4 ETSAP’s tools future development (Attachment E4)

Mr. Ken Noble presented the implications of his decision to retire on the future development of ANSWER. Mr. Noble offered to update ANSWER-TIMES with new TIMES features until the end of 2017 provided that ETSAP will fund this according to the setup applied in the previous years. The delegates agreed with this approach and in principle decided to fund the continuation of ANSWER support in 2017. This will give adequate time for a possible transition. In the long term ANSWER could work on dedicated machines without operating system updates.

The Chair and the delegates acknowledged the fact that ETSAP tools have not been developed significantly over the last years. One approach to address this is for the users to request the desired features that should be added to the interfaces that will then be funded as ETSAP projects.

Mr. Gary Goldstein presented proposals for the future development of ETSAP tools with a focus on VEDA development and the TIMES-Starter model (Attachment E4).

From the discussion among delegates it was noted that the interaction between tool developers with ETSAP members is needed when putting together proposals for tools updates. The creation of two working groups was proposed: one for promoting the discussion and creating a list of desired updates for the ETSAP tools and one group for discussing the approach for promoting the use of tools in developing countries. The work of the first group will be done through the existing forum where participants should publish their ideas. The second group on developing countries will be coordinated by Tom Kober and Ken Karlsson. One of the comments made during the discussion was that the cost of licenses is an important hurdle for developing countries.

After discussion the delegates decided to update the evaluation of ETSAP projects procedure by interpreting the *participation criteria* as the number of partners who participate or will benefit from the project to rebalance between collective activities (e.g. workshops with potentially many partners involved) and tools development (with potentially many partners benefitting).

5. Annex XIII (2014-2016): Tools for Analysis of a Future Energy Revolution

5.1 Progress of current projects and ETSAP tools (Attachment E5)

ANNEX XIII: TOOLS FOR ANALYSIS OF A FUTURE ENERGY REVOLUTION

The O.A presented the progress of the currently funded projects by ETSAP (details in Attachment E5).

5.2 *Annex XIII 2015 Budget Report (Attachment E6)*

The O.A. presented the total income of ETSAP for 2015, comprising the fees of 16 paying contracting parties and the fees of the training courses, and the total expenses and payments that took place in 2015 (Attachment E6). Ms. Espegren commented on the cost of covering expenses for traveling to the workshops and proposed to discuss this in the next ExCo when discussing the budget of the next year and to have a separate budget line for IEW sponsorship in the budget presentation.

According to the decision of the 61st ExCo meeting (point 4.3), the report of the accounting system of the O.A. will replace the report of external auditors for the annual accounts of ETSAP. The delegates unanimously approved the annual accounts for 2015 submitted by the O.A. (Attachment E6).

6. Other business

6.1 *Election of a Chairperson.*

The O.A. assumed the Chair in order to proceed with the election of the Chairperson for the next twelve months. Mr. Giannakidis proposed Mr. Ó Gallachóir as the Chairperson for the next year and the two Deputy-Chairpersons Ms. Virdis and Mr. Blesl for the position of the Vice Chairs. The delegates agreed unanimously and Mr. Ó Gallachóir was confirmed as a chair for next year. Mr. Blesl and Ms. Virdis were voted as deputy-chairpersons. Mr. Ó Gallachóir assumed the chair.

6.2 *Next workshop and ExCo meeting: Madrid, 17-18 November 2016.*

The autumn 2016 meeting will be held in Madrid on 17-18 November 2016, hosted by CIEMAT.

6.3 *Successive meetings:*

The summer meeting of 2017 will be held back to back with IEW 2017 which is scheduled to take place in University of Maryland College Park, MD, USA.

An invitation was offered by the delegate of Kazakhstan to hold the autumn meeting of 2017 in Astana, during the period of Expo 2017 (10th June - 10th September) and an invitation was re-iterated by the delegate of Belgium to host one of the future workshops. Switzerland offered to host the project meeting together with the workshop on water use in PSI.

6.4 *Other Topics*

Mr. Nijns announced that JRC Directorate C - Energy, Transport and Climate is considering providing open access to the JRC-EU-TIMES model, in line with the new JRC strategy, starting with the excel data templates. JRC would like to know if TIMES can be open source as well. The O.A. explained that the TIMES code is open source and available to anyone who signs the Letter of Agreement. The delegates expressed their views that this approach of sharing models is very good for improving models quality and acceptability.

Regarding the fees mechanisms of other TCPs the O.A. will check with the IEA secretariat on the approaches followed and will report in the next ExCo.

The delegates approved to move the project for “Integrated Water Modelling in TIMES - Moving towards best practice” approved in the 68th ExCo from ECN to PSI.

ANNEX XIII: TOOLS FOR ANALYSIS OF A FUTURE ENERGY REVOLUTION

The Chair proposed for ETSAP to establish the **Tosato Grant** to provide support for trainees from less developed countries to attend ETSAP's training courses and the ETSAP workshop. The annual amount allocated will be €10,000, and the allocation will be decided by the O.A. and the Chair, based on the request.

On a final point, the Chair informed the delegates that there is a request by Politecnico di Torino for ETSAP's support to a proposal for a side event in Habitat III conference to be held by the IEA in Quito on 17th - 20th October 2016. If the proposal is accepted ETSAP will cover the expenses of two ETSAP members to participate in the event and present ETSAP's work. The delegates approved the support and in the case of acceptance will cover the expenses of two ETSAP members to participate.

The Chair closed the meeting at 19:00 thanking the participants.