

ANNEX XVI (2023-2025):  
ALIGNING ENERGY SECURITY WITH ZERO EMISSIONS ENERGY SYSTEMS

## MINUTES - 93<sup>e</sup> EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

Date: Thursday, March 21, 2024 (11:00-13:00 CET)  
 Venue: Online participation only  
 Online: Teams link is included in the calendar invitation  
 Contacts: Kathleen Vaillancourt, ([kathleen@esmia.ca](mailto:kathleen@esmia.ca)), Brian Ó Gallachóir ([b.ogallachoir@ucc.ie](mailto:b.ogallachoir@ucc.ie)),  
 George Giannakidis ([ggiannakidis.gg@gmail.com](mailto:ggiannakidis.gg@gmail.com))

## AGENDA

<b>No.</b>	<b>ITEM</b>	<b>DOCS</b>
<b>1.</b>	<b>QUORUM COUNT</b>	
<b>2.</b>	<b>ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA</b>	
<b>3.</b>	<b>MINUTES OF THE 92<sup>e</sup> EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE</b>	
	3.1 Minutes of the 92 <sup>e</sup> Executive Committee	<b>A1</b>
	3.2 Matters arising	
<b>4.</b>	<b>IEA-ETSAP IMPLEMENTING AGREEMENT</b>	
	4.1 Communication from the Secretariat	<b>A2</b>
	a) Request for Extension	<b>A3</b>
	4.2 Relation with IEA and other TCPs	
	a) TCP coordination groups	<b>A4</b>
	b) Collaboration with other TCPs (IETS, etc.)	
	4.3 ETSAP Participation and Outreach activities	
<b>5.</b>	<b>ANNEX XVI (2023-2025): ALIGNING ENERGY SECURITY WITH ZERO EMISSIONS ENERGY SYSTEMS</b>	
	5.1 Short status report from Operating Agent	<b>A5</b>
	5.2 Budget and Economy 2023 & 2024	<b>A6</b>
	5.3 Request for material for the 2023 Annual Report	<b>A7</b>
	5.4 Advanced TIMES Training	
	5.5 Project updates	
<b>6.</b>	<b>OTHER BUSINESS</b>	
	6.1 94 ExCo meeting (in-person): Bonn, June 25, 2024: 8h-11h local time	
	6.2 Other meetings:	
	- ETSAP Summer Workshop 2024 (in-person): Bonn, June 24-25, 2024	
	- ETSAP 95 ExCo meeting (online): September?	
	- ETSAP Winter Workshop 2024 (in-person): volunteers to host?	
	6.3 TIMES Documentation (new)	
	6.4 VEDA Forum (new)	

## 1. QUORUM COUNT

As indicated in Annex 1, there were representatives from 14 Contracting Parties, ensuring a quorum for the ExCo meeting to proceed formally. The ExCo meeting was chaired by Brian Ó Gallachóir. Key notes:

- A warm welcome to Canada, officially rejoining the ETSAP TCP ExCo.
- A reminder that the Russian Federation remains suspended from the ETSAP TCP including participation in ExCo meetings.

## 2. ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

The chair introduced the agenda comprising 6 items. Special attention was given to item 4.1 - Request for extension as an important topic to cover.

The ExCo discussed and adopted the agenda with some additional item as follows:

- **TIMES Documentation (added under 6.3 - Other business):** A written request from Australia regarding the TIMES documentation was received after drafting the agenda.
- **Participation in the VEDA Forum (added under 6.4 – Participation to VEDA forum):** Amit raised the issue of forum participation, where Antti provides nearly all of the responses, noting that requests are anticipated to further grow due to the free VEDA online.
- **Research contracts (covered under 3.2 - Matters arising):** Tiina emphasized the need for a standardized approach to contracts, especially for multi-party projects, to reduce administrative burdens and facilitate smoother collaboration.
- **Long term vision (covered under 4.1 - Request for extension):** Kanan initiated a conversation on the long-term vision for model development, questioning the sustainability of current practices given the evolving challenges and the need for new tools over the next 20 years.

## 3. MINUTES OF THE 92<sup>ND</sup> EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

### ➤ 3.1 Minutes of the 92 Executive Committee

No suggested changes were raised and the ExCo adopted the minutes of the 92<sup>nd</sup> ExCo Meeting. The chair expressed gratitude to Markus Blesl, for stepping in as chair of the 92<sup>nd</sup> ExCo Meeting in his absence.

**Review of the action list** (actions that required additional discussion are covered in Section 3.2 - Matters arising):

- **Coordinate with IEA on joint trainings/workshops:** George recalled the group about a workshop that is been organized in Denmark by the Danish Energy Agency for the Energy Ministry of Ukraine. He is waiting for communication proposals from ExCo members.
- **New ETSAP book:** The chair announced that the manuscript and consent forms were submitted to Springer by the end of February. The book, featuring 16 chapters and a foreword by Dr. Fatih Birol, is expected to be a substantial contribution. The launch is planned as a side event in June during the International Energy Workshop (IEW) hosted this year by IRENA. This online version of the book will be available freely as open access, following a funding decision by the ExCo to maximize outreach beyond the academic community. ExCo members are encouraged to actively participate in the book's dissemination upon its launch.
- **ETSAP engagement with IETS TCP:** Discussions have been progressing to organise a joint workshop on industry decarbonization in 2024 to foster increased collaboration between the ETSAP TCP and the IETS TCP.
  - o Anna noted a recent workshop held in Sweden with the IETS, proposing to integrate this initiative with the ETSAP project on industry decarbonization led by Markus.
  - o Kathleen added that Jocelyn's group at Canmet (Canada) were actively engaged with this IETS TCP and could play a role in reinforcing the collaboration with the ETSAP TCP as well.
- **ETSAP-TIAM documentation:** A link to the online TIAM documentation has been shared with all contracting parties for feedback. Inputs from UCL (Paul Dodd's team) and Ecole des Mines (Nadia's team) have been incorporated, with Markus requested additional comments and feedback from other Contracting Parties. The process is being managed through GitHub to facilitate collaboration and version control. Once the revised

draft is finalized, all parties will be solicited again to review and agree to the latest version and whether it should be in open access.

- **Annual report 2023:** Kathleen has distributed a template to collect materials on contributions and achievements in 2023. All Contracting Parties were requested to complete and submit the template as soon as possible, especially material showcasing real-world applications and TIMES models' advisory role in government and decision-making processes.
- **Webinars:** George informed the ExCo of the possibility that a webinar will be organised in relation with the research project on behavior modelling led by Pernille (IFE).

### ➤ 3.2 Matters arising

**Improved format and process for research contracts:** Tiina raised the need to simplify the contractual process for research projects and reduce the administrative burden, especially for complex projects with multiple partners, and consequently, multiple subcontractors. Proposed solutions and actions items:

- James: Proposed direct contracts between project collaborators and the operating agent as a solution to eliminate the need for subcontracts.
- Kathleen/Kari: Mentioned the possibility consulting with a lawyer to draft a standard contract for all subcontractors. However, future project proposals would require clearly defined tasks, responsibilities among partners, and separate budgets to allow for individual invoicing.
- Kathleen/Kari/Tiina/James: Agreed to continue discussions on refining the contract process, with Kathleen leading the effort to develop practical solutions to be presented at the next ExCo.

**Migrating TIMES from GAMS to Julia (€50k reserve):** The ExCo received a proposal for migrating TIMES from GAMS to Julia, led by Stevens Institute of Technology. The initial budget reserved for this feasibility study was up to €50,000, but the submitted proposal significantly exceeded this, totalling €130,000, including high overhead costs. ExCo members raised concerns about the scale of the discrepancy between what was reserved and requested and no one was available to speak to this issue from the proposal team. The ExCo decided to defer a decision requesting the ExCo management team to engage with the proposal team to discuss budget concerns and to request a revised proposal that aligns with the allocated €50,000 budget to be presented at the 94<sup>th</sup> ExCo meeting in Bonn.

## 4. IEA-ETSAP IMPLEMENTING AGREEMENT

### ➤ 4.1 Communication from the Secretariat

Uwe provided an update on the recent IEA's activities, highlighting key publications and achievements: a report on CO<sub>2</sub> emissions in 2023, a report tracking CCS projects globally, etc. He informed the ExCo that all of these reports are freely available on the IEA [website](#).

A central point of the update was the biennial Ministerial meeting marking the IEA's 50th anniversary, jointly with the Energy Innovation Forum (a video is [available](#)). This event facilitated discussions on technological innovation, gathering a diverse range of participants (John Kerry as the U.S. Climate Envoy, deputy ministers, industry, companies, startups, investors, etc.) from various countries. A summary document will be released with mention of some TCPs, a Technology Advisory Board aimed at innovation will be created, and a working party on industrial decarbonization will be set up. Brian expressed his appreciation for the opportunity to participate in the Energy Innovation Forum, highlighting it was an excellent and forward-looking event.

Other updates reported by Uwe:

- Upcoming publications include the next World Energy Outlook 2024, the next Energy Technology Perspectives (ETP) focusing on energy technology supply chains and trade, and a special IEA report on batteries.
- A new IEA office in Singapore is being opened to improve collaboration in the South Asia region.
- Ongoing efforts to welcome India as an IEA member and to diversify its membership base.

### ***b) Request for Extension***

Brian presented the request for extension (RfE) process, due every five years, that requires to reflect on the past five years and to outline proposals for the next five years. This involves producing three key documents: 1) an End-of-Term Report, 2) a RfE questionnaire, and 3) a Strategic Work Plan for the next five years.

The goal is to draft these documents in time for the summer ExCo meeting, aiming for a collective decision to proceed with the extension request. Brian has been requested to present the 'Strategic Communication 2025-2030' (which is a preliminary summary version of strategic work plan) the at the IEA CERT meeting on October 22-23, 2024. A detailed timeline was also shared up to the June 2025 closing date.

Immediate suggestions for the Strategic Work Plan (2 pages) from the EXCO members:

- Anna: Importance of documentation and educational materials for a deeper understanding of energy system models and for communication purposes.
- Pieter: Impacts on infrastructure (transmission lines, oil & gas pipelines) and differentiation between public and private investments.
- Kannan: Sustainability and evolution of TIMES model generator over the next 15+ years, emphasizing the need for continuous maintenance and development of new models. Importance of technology data and capacity building to foster a new generation of TIMES users and developers.
- Tiina: Importance of infrastructure, critical minerals, low demand scenarios, data.
- Marcus: Need to support decision-makers by making our models more transparent so that it increases reliability.

ExCo members were invited to submit additional written suggestions for the strategic work plan within two weeks to the Operating Agent.

## ➤ **4.2 Relation with IEA and other TCPs**

### ***a) TCP coordination groups***

New collaborative opportunities have emerged with other TCPs (Technology Collaboration Programmes) under the IEA, thanks to the recent creation of six coordination groups focused on specific themes: carbon management, critical minerals, energy system flexibility, thermal networks, heat pumps, and hydrogen.

Members are encouraged to informally reach out to the coordination groups that match their interests and report these interactions to the ETSAP Management Team before the next ExCo Summer meeting. ETSAP is already identified as part of the Critical Minerals coordination group, but members have the flexibility to engage with any group.

The success of this initiative relies on active participation from ExCo members; it is an opportunity to expand ETSAP's influence and collaborative network within the IEA ecosystem.

### ***b) Collaboration with other TCPs (IETS, etc.)***

Previously covered in Agenda item 3.1 during review of action items.

## ➤ **4.3 ETSAP Participation and Outreach activities**

Brian noted the recent positive developments with Canada (who have rejoined the ExCo) and the ongoing discussions with KAPSARC.

In addition, ETSAP remains engaged in the Clean Energy Ministerial Initiative on long-term energy scenarios (LTES), led by IRENA. Members participate as representatives of their countries. This ongoing activity allows ETSAP to contribute to broader dialogue on energy topics and scenario planning at the global scale (this will be discussed further in Bonn with IRENA).

ANNEX XVI (2023-2025):  
ALIGNING ENERGY SECURITY WITH ZERO EMISSIONS ENERGY SYSTEMS

## 5. ANNEX XVI (2023-2025): ALIGNING ENERGY SECURITY WITH ZERO EMISSIONS ENERGY SYSTEMS

### ➤ 5.1 Short status report from Operating Agent

Kathleen, the new operating agent, presented her status report. The focus since the beginning of the year 2024 was dedicated to establishing a new entity (non-profit corporation), the Global Energy Modeling Agency (GEMA). This involved setting up new bank accounts (CAD, USA, EUR), transferring documents and reorganizing official TEAMS channels (shared to all), the PayPal and the FormSmart accounts for online registration to trainings, and revising contracts for research projects and consultancies under Quebec law.

Updates in terms of financial activities are:

- The first 400,000 Euros from IFE was received.
- All Contracting Parties have been contacted to pay the 2024 memberships fees.
- Expenses are less than initially required (5000 Euros), excluding the insurance issue.

Additionally, preparations are underway for upcoming ETSAP TIMES training sessions and the Bonn ETSAP Workshop and ExCo meeting.

All individual contracts for research projects (4 contracts accounting for 149800 € in total) and consultancies (7 contracts accounting for 144000 € in total) have been prepared, sent, and signed except one. This excludes the budget reserves for the Operating Agent (27000 €).

### ➤ 5.2 Budget and Economy 2023 & 2024

For 2023, Kari outlined efforts to address the non-payment of membership fees from three contracting parties—Australia, France, and Greece—, alongside a minor payment from Wallonia, Belgium. An initial transfer of €400,000 has been made to the new operating agent; an additional transfer of approximately €40,000 will follow the finalization of the 2023 budget. IFE retains funds to cover ongoing research projects not yet completed.

For 2024, all contracting parties were requested to pay their participation fees. Only, the Netherlands confirmed they would not be making a payment, as in the previous year.

Brian raised concerns regarding the non-payment of fees by certain countries, wondering if this was a once off issue or a developing trend. A review of payment history is planned to assess patterns of non-payment among contracting parties and to inform on strategies for engaging with these countries. It is critical to ensure financial stability and participation equity within ETSAP.

### ➤ 5.3 Request for material for the 2023 Annual Report

Covered during review of action items.

### ➤ 5.4 Advanced TIMES Training

There is interest in advanced TIMES training focusing on more complex features and applications of the TIMES model generator, such as load duration curves, storage, flexible time slice definitions, and solver optimizations.

- The ExCo requested that George coordinate a working group to gather suggestions on the training content and explore potential instructors. The plan is to refine these ideas into a concrete proposal to be presented at the next meeting.
- Markus suggested recording the advance training sessions for broader access.

### ➤ 5.5 Project updates

Due to time pressures, the project updates was deferred to the next meeting,

## 6. OTHER BUSINESS

➤ **6.1 94 ExCo meeting (in-person): Bonn, June 25, 2024: 14h-17h local time**

➤ **6.2 Other meetings:**

- ETSAP Summer Workshop 2024 (in-person): Bonn, June 24-25, 2024
  - o Preparations in progress, all going well.
- ETSAP 95 ExCo meeting (online): September?
  - o Exact dates not decided yet and will depend on the Winter Workshop dates as well.
- ETSAP Winter Workshop 2024 (in-person): volunteers to host?
  - o Offers to host the winter workshop were received from Norway and Finland. Brian suggested that it could be interesting for new Contracting parties to host meetings and established the links with local decision makers.

**6.3 TIMES Documentation (new)**

The TIMES documentation project aims at making the materials more accessible online, but this does not replace the need for updating and maintaining the traditional Word/PDF format, especially on the short term. The ExCo agreed to keep both versions for now.

**6.4 VEDA/ETSAP forums (new)**

In addition to the great contribution of Antti to the VEDA forum, there is a need for more people to contribute. A significant portion of the questions could be addressed by a broader group of experts. Amit suggested the creation of a structured mechanism for engagement. The ExCo requested that George discuss this issue with the same group that will discuss advanced TIMES training.

## 7. AGREED ACTIONS

➤ **To do**

Action list from this ExCo meeting	Owner
Engage with the Julia proposal team to discuss budget concerns and request a revised proposal for €50,000 max.	Brian/George/Kathleen
Prepare three documents for RfE: 1) Strategic Communication 2) an End-of-Term Report, 3) a RfE questionnaire, and 4) a Strategic Work Plan for the next five years.	Brian/George/Kathleen
Gather ideas for the RfE Strategic Work Plan	Kathleen
Present a review of payment history	Kathleen/Kari
Coordinate a working group to set-up advanced trainings	George
Coordinate a working group to discuss the creation of a structured mechanism for engagement in forums	George
Annual report 2023 – submit highlights from 2023 to Kathleen	All Contracting Parties

➤ **Ongoing**

Action list from previous ExCo meetings	Owner
Continue discussions on refining the contract process for sub-contractors	Kathleen/Kari/Tiina/James

Extend suspension of Russian Federation from participating in ETSAP TCP activities until there is a change in the circumstances that resulted in the suspension	ExCo
If there is a delay in the meeting documents, the ExCo will be informed by e-mail.	Brian
Support existing ExCo members and engage with interested parties seeking to become Contracting Parties	George/Brian/Kathleen
Follow up the process of KAPSARC joining ETSAP since the invitation letters have been sent.	Brian/George
Seek to coordinate with IEA on joint training workshops for IEA Association Countries	George / Uwe
New ETSAP book	Maryse – plan for launch at IEW 2024
Rising the visibility of TIMES and organize a marketing strategy	CPs to propose projects for funding related to the increase of visibility of TIMES.
Engage with interested parties to join ETSAP in Vietnam	George/Maurizio
ETSAP members working on industry decarbonization to increase the engagement with IETS TCP. Plan for the common workshops that were proposed in 2024.	Anna/ExCo Members
Share the link for the ETSAP-TIAM documentation with all CPs for comments and inputs.	Markus
Finalize the process of transferring the O.A. from IFE to ESMIA (a portion of the budget remain to be transferred after all 2023 contracts are closed)	Brian/Kari/Kathleen/George
Follow up on the pending invoices for the fees of 2023	Kari/Linda
Continue with ETSAP webinar series – ExCo members to encourage participation and to propose webinar topics to George.	George / Paul / ETSAP CP

➤ Done

Action list from previous ExCo meetings	Owner
Improved format and process for contracts will be updated by the new O.A. who will issue the contracts in 2024	Kathleen
Follow up the process of Canada joining ETSAP since the invitation letters have been sent.	Brian/George
Submit a detailed proposal for study on migrating TIMES from GAMS to VEDA.	Gary and other CPs interested to participate in the process
Reserve €50k for a study on migrating TIMES from GAMS to Julia to be decided at the next 93 <sup>rd</sup> ExCo subject to approval of a detailed proposal.	Kathleen / ExCo
Annual report 2023: Send template for seeking contributions from each CP	Kathleen
Plan for a training in Vietnam	George/Maurizio

## Annex 1: Participants

N.	Country	Contracting Party	Delegate	Yes	Alternate	Yes	Nominate	Yes
1	Australia	CSIRO	Mr. Luke Reedman		Mr. Thomas Brinsmead		Mr. James Foster Mr. Stephen Craig	
2	Belgium	VITO/SPW/Brussels	Mr. Frank Meinke-Hubeny Ms. Martha Cadena Barros Ms. Camille Romain		Mr. Pieter Lodewijks Ms. Nathalie Arnould	√		
3	Canada	CanmetENERGY	Mr. Jocelyn Millette	√	Ms. Kathleen Vaillancourt	√		
4	Denmark	ENS	Mr. Steffen Dockweiler	√	Mr. Lars B. Termansen			
5	Finland	VTT/Business Finland	Mr. Jussi Mäkelä		Ms. Tiina Koljonen, Vice Chair	√		
6	France	ADEME/EDMP/ DGEMPEDAD	Mr. Jean-Louis Bergey		Mr. Richard Lavergne		Ms Nadia Maizi Ms. Sandrine Selosse	
7	Germany	IER	Mr. Markus Blesl, Vice chair	√	Mr. Christoph Jessen	√		
8	Greece	CRES	Mr. Philip Siakkis		Mr. George Giannakidis	√		
9	Ireland	SEAI	Mr. Brian Ó Gallachoir, Chair	√	Padraig Daly			
10	Italy	ENEA	Ms. Maria Gaeta		Mr. Fabio Lanati	√		
11	Japan	IEEJ	Mr. Yuhji MATSUO		Mr. Seiya Endo			
12	Kazakhstan	NURIS						
13	Korea	KEA	Mr. Kang Hoon Lee	√ late	Hye Bin Jan	√ late		
14	Netherlands	TNO	Mr. Bob van der Zwaan					
15	New Zealand	EECA	Mr. Vincent Smart	√				
16	Norway	IFE	Ms. Kari Aamodt Espegren	√				
17	Russia							
18	Singapore	SIMTECH	Mr Jonathan (Sze Choong) Low		Mr. Tang WeyLin		Mr. Aloisius Rabata Purnama	√
19	Spain	CIEMAT	Ms. Yolanda Lechón	√				
20	Sweden	STEM	Mr. Erik Sandberg		Mr. Erik Ahlgren Ms. Anna Krook-Riekkola	√		
21	Switzerland	PSI	Ms. Anne-Kathrin Faust		Mr. Evangelos Panos		Mr. Kannan Ramachandran	√
22	UK	BEIS	Mr. Barry-Jon De Souza	√	Mr. Paul Dodds Mr. Steve Pye			
23	US	DOE	Mr. Sauleh Siddiqui		Ms. Angelina LaRose			

 Quorum count

## Annex 2: Officers and guests

N.	Name	Organisation	Role	Yes
1	GianCarlo Tosato	Asatrem	Previous ETSAP Project Head	
2	Uwe Remme	IEA	IEA representative	√
3	Antti Lehtila	VTT, Finland	TIMES Maintenance	√
4	George Giannakidis	Freelance	ETSAP Project Head	√
5	Kathleen Vaillancourt	ESMIA	ETSAP Operating Agent	√
6	Amit Kanudia	Kanors	VEDA License	√
7	Maurizio Gargiulo	E4SMA	VEDA-TIMES basic trainings	
8	Gary Goldstein	DecisionWare	Liaison Officer	
9	James Glynn	CGEP – Columbia University	Expert	√
10	Olex Balyk	CGEP – Columbia University	Expert	
11	Pernille Seljom	IFE	Expert	
12	Kenneth Karlsson	Energy Modelling Lab	Expert	
13	Maryse Labriet	ENERIS	Expert	
14				
15				