

MINUTES OF THE 92ND EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MEETING

Date: Thursday, November 16, 2023 (09:00 - 12.00 CEST)
 Venue: Politecnico di Torino, Corso Duca degli Abruzzi 24, Sala Riunioni ex DELET - DENERG (2nd floor)
 Online: Teams link is included in the calendar invitation
 Contacts: Kari Espegren, (kari.esepgren@ife.no), Brian Ó Gallachóir (b.ogallachoir@ucc.ie),
 George Giannakidis (ggiannakidis.gg@gmail.com)

Table 1: Participants

N.	Country	Participant	Delegate	Attended	Stand-ins
1	Australia	CSIRO	Mr. Luke REEDMAN	Yes	James Foster
2	Belgium	VITO/SPW/Brussels	Mr. Frank Meinke-Hubeny	Yes	Pieter Lodewijks
3	Denmark	ENS	Mr. Kristoffer Steen Andersen	Yes	Steffen Dockweiler
4	Finland	VTT/Business Finland	Jussi Mäkelä	Yes	Tiina Koljonen, Vice Chair
5	France	ADEME/EDMP/DGEMPEDAD	Mr. Emmanuel Combet Ms Nadia Maïzi	Yes	Sandrine Seloisse
6	Germany	IER	Mr. Markus BLESL, Vice chair	Yes	
7	Greece	CRES	Mr. Philip Siakkis	No	
8	Italy	ENEA	Ms. Maria Gaeta	Yes	Fabio Lanati
9	Ireland	SEAI	Mr. Brian Ó GALLACHÓIR, Chair	NO	
10	Japan	IEEJ	Mr. Yuhji MATSUO	Yes	Seiya Endo
11	Kazakhstan	NURIS		No	
12	Korea	KEA	Mr. Chang Seung-chan	Yes	
13	Netherlands	TNO	Mr. Bob van der ZWAAN	No	
14	New Zealand	EECA	Mr. Vincent Smart	Yes	
15	Norway	IFE	Ms. Kari Aamodt ESPEGREN	Yes	
16	Russia			-	
17	Singapore	SIMTECH	Mr Jonathan (Sze Choong) Low	No	
18	Spain	CIEMAT	Ms. Yolanda Lechón	Yes	
19	Sweden	STEM	Ms. Josefin THORESSON	Yes	Anna Krook-Riekola
20	Switzerland	PSI	Ms. Anne-Kathrin FAUST	Yes	Tom Kober
21	UK	BEIS	Barry-Jon De Souza	Yes	Paul Dodds
22	US	DOE	Sauleh Siddiqui	No	
23	Sponsor	ENEL Foundation	Mr. Carlo PAPA	No	

Table 2: Officers and guests

GianCarlo Tosato		Amit Kanudia	Kanors
Antti Lehtila	VTT, Finland	Gary Goldstein	DecisionWare
Pernille Seljom	IFE	Kenneth Karlsson	Energy Modelling Lab
Bart Van Brabant	EnergyVille/VITO	Kathleen Vaillancourt	ESMIA
Maurizio Gargiulo	E4SMA	George Giannakidis	ETSAP Project Head
Daniele Lerede	Politecnico di Torino		
Rocco De Miglio	Freelance		

ANNEX XVI (2023-2025):
ALIGNING ENERGY SECURITY WITH ZERO EMISSIONS ENERGY SYSTEMS

DRAFT AGENDA AS OF 31 OCTOBER 2023

No.	ITEM	DOCS
1	QUORUM COUNT	
2	ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA	
3	MINUTES OF THE 91 ST EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE	
	3.1 Final Minutes of the 91 st Executive Committee	Z1
	3.2 Matters arising	
	a) ETSAP research project contracts	Z2
	b) ETSAP-TIAM status	
4	IEA-ETSAP IMPLEMENTING AGREEMENT	
	4.1 Communication from the Secretariat	Z3
	a) Outcomes of fifth universal TCP meeting in Paris	
	4.2 ETSAP Participation and Outreach activities	
5	ANNEX XVI (2023-2025): ALIGNING ENERGY SECURITY WITH ZERO EMISSIONS ENERGY SYSTEMS	
	5.1 Short status report from Operating Agent	Z4
	5.2 Status report from ongoing research projects	
	5.3 Budget and Economy 2023	Z5
	5.4 New project proposals	Z6
	5.5 Election of new ETSAP Operating agent from 2024	Z7
7	OTHER BUSINESS	
	7.1 93 rd ExCo meeting (online): date to be decided by ExCo (spring 2024).	
	7.2 Other meetings:	
	ETSAP summer WS and 94 th ExCo: 24-25 June 2024, back-to-back with IEW (26-28 June 2024)	
	ETSAP winter WS 2024: volunteers to host?	
	7.3 AOB	

Attachments

-
- Z1 Minutes and Action list from the 91st ExCo meeting, September 18, 2023
 - Z2 Simplified contracts for ETSAP funded Projects
 - Z3 Communication from the Secretariat
 - Z4 Short status report from Operating Agent
 - Z5 Budget and Economy 2023
 - Z6 New project proposals
 - Z7 Election of new ETSAP Operating agent from 2024

Teams folder with all documents: [92nd ExCo meeting](#)

1. QUORUM COUNT

Quorum is 12. There are 15 participants present, so there is quorum. In the absence of the ExCo Chair the meeting was chaired by Mr Markus Blesl, Vice Chair.

2. ADOPTION OF AGENDA

Anna Krook-Riekkola suggested adding an item in the “Other category” about the Winter workshop. With this addition the ExCo adopted the agenda.

3. MINUTES OF THE 91TH EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE

3.1 Final Minutes of the 91st Executive Committee

Action list :

- About coordination with the TCP-IETS. The group is actively coordinating and working with the TCP-IETS. This includes participation in a potential online joined workshop, consolidating ongoing engagement between the two entities. Ms. Anna Krook-Riekkola already leads the liaison between the two groups, facilitating the coordination with the TCP-IETS. There is an existing collaboration between the Swedish industry, members of the TCP in Sweden, and the TIMES community in Sweden. Anna offered to be a contact point for those interested in being a part of this collaboration. A suggestion was made to consider having a joint in-person workshop, possibly aligning it with an already planned workshop. The idea was positively received, with the belief that it would be beneficial.
- ETSAP-TIAM: the project team wishes to organize a workshop to present the new documentation and invite experts to review this documentation. After the review process is completed, there will be a need to discuss the next steps.
- Brian O’Galachoir participated in the Universal TCP meeting, which took place in Paris in October.
- Operating agent: The Project Head contacted all CP to discuss their interest in becoming the next operating agent, but nobody expressed interest given that it involves a considerable amount of administrative work. However, there is finally one proposal to be discussed under point 5.5.
- Converting TIMES to another programming language: The conversation indicated that while there has been some interest in this conversion, progress has been limited due to the unavailability of key technical people like Antti Lehtila. Additionally, a recent development was reported by GAMS about a Python link, which could potentially be relevant.
- Continuing webinars: No new proposals for additional webinars were received over the last period. Kari Espegren suggested that the ETSAP funded research projects could also be good topics for webinars.

3.2 Matters arising

a) ETSAP research project contracts

There was a discussion about the complexities involved in managing research project contracts, particularly focusing on the challenges that arise when applicants are not fully aware of their

contractual obligations. The Operating Agent faced several challenges, particularly when these contracts are reviewed by the legal departments of their respective institutions.

So, it was proposed to create a simplified and unique contract template to make things easier. This template would ensure that all project applicants have a clear understanding of the terms they agree to, thereby reducing misunderstandings and conflicts. The discussion also touched upon the payment structure, emphasizing that payments should be made upon project completion. There were also talks about how to handle intellectual property (IP) rights, the choice of law (country of the operating agent), and the choice of the currency (euros). A document outlining these issues and proposals, titled 'Simplified Research Project Contracts,' was circulated by the operating agent. Given the impending change in the operating agent, it was decided to defer final decisions on this matter. The role of the new operating agent was acknowledged as crucial in finalizing these new contracts. It was suggested to wait for the new agent to review and potentially revise the contract template.

Tiina Koljonen suggested a two-step approach: first, to draft a version to be checked by the new operating agent, and then to circulate it again to the CP for any concerns or issues to be raised. CP were advised to consult their legal offices about the draft contract in advance, facilitating a productive discussion in future meetings. The plan is to circulate the draft among ExCo members for input and feedback.

b) ETSAP-TIAM status

Markus Blesl provided an update on the current status. He informed the ExCo that the initial version of the ETSAP-TIAM documentation has been fully completed. The team is now thinking to organizing a workshop, which will serve two purposes: firstly, to present this newly completed documentation, and secondly, to initiate a review process by inviting the group to critically assess the documentation. He proposed that the documentation's link should be shared with all members of the ExCo. This step would ensure that all ExCo members have access to the latest version of the documentation and can contribute to the process by providing their insights and feedback.

4 IEA-ETSAP IMPLEMENTING AGREEMENT

4.1 Communication from the Secretariat

Kari Espegren mentioned that Uwe Remme was not there to present, but he provided material that she presented. A particular focus was given to the IEA's recent publications, especially the Net Zero Roadmap, which was to be presented in a workshop the following day. The secretary encouraged attendees to access these publications online for more detailed information.

a) Outcomes of fifth universal TCP meeting in Paris

Brian Ó Gallachóir attended the fifth universal TCP meeting in Paris, and Kari Espegren provided a summary of the outcome. The goal of the meeting was to build a stronger, more connected TCP network. According to Brian, the meeting was successful, fostering discussions among various TCPs and enhancing collaboration with ETSAP. The importance of better collaboration between different TCPs was highlighted, noting existing collaborations with groups like hydrogen and bioenergy and the potential for new collaborations within the vast network of 39 TCPs, covering diverse technology areas.

An email received after the meeting requested historical materials (reports, photos, videos) for creating a narrative about the TCP's history. The deadline for contributions was set for December 20th.

The secretary also mentioned a proposal for new TCP groups, with numerous initiatives and contact persons highlighted. This proposal is open to all groups interested in joining the coordination efforts.

4.2 ETSAP Participation and Outreach activities

Canada. It was mentioned that Canada has shown interest in rejoining the organization. Brian had positive discussions with a colleague from Natural Resources Canada, and there is an optimistic view about Canada's participation.

KAPSARC. Following a decision in a previous Executive Committee meeting, it was agreed to invite KAPSARC. The process involves sending out letters to continue discussions with KAPSARC. These letters need approval from the relevant authorities, as KAPSARC is located outside the usual geographic scope of the organization. George expressed hope that all technicalities would be resolved smoothly, leading to two new participations in the coming year.

Vietnam. An institution from Vietnam expressed interest in further collaboration. It was proposed to try and organise a workshop or a training session in South Asia over the next year. This will be explored further with Maurizio Gargiulo.

5 ANNEX XVI (2023-2025): ALIGNING ENERGY SECURITY WITH ZERO EMISSIONS ENERGY SYSTEMS

5.1 Short status report from Operating Agent

Z4

Kari provided an overview of the activities, including internal meetings and discussions with various partners such as CGEP (via James). This information was included in the documentation prepared for the meeting.

Kari highlighted a recent development regarding a project proposal from the previous year. It was noted that the institution involved in the project had decided they could not sign the contract. Consequently, they chose to release the funding for other purposes. This decision has implications for future projects and collaborations.

There were no immediate questions or reactions to the status report.

5.2 Status report from ongoing research projects

Status report for ongoing projects.

- **Modelling of new and advanced energy storage technologies and a collaboration with TCP Energy Storage.** Tom Kober provided an update, mentioning that the final report is expected by the end of the year. The project involves a technology database update and best practices for energy storage, aligning with other TCP storage projects.
- **Nesting spatial and temporal resolution in the TIMES source code and VEDA.2.0 to enable parametric scaling for exploration of structural uncertainty.** The project was planned to have a design version first and then decide if it was feasible to implement. But it was noted that the project is still in the design phase, with some considerable challenges encountered, and it is not possible that it could be completed by the end of the year. Tiina clarified that there had been a very long phase until all contractual issues were clarified. Markus Blesl

- mentioned that we need to decide what is the prolongation rules and how to make them and Kari clarified that all new contracts, have a sunset clause.
- **Workshops on energy trade and behaviour in TIMES models.** Pernille: the project is going according to plan, and the project is close to be finalized by the end of the year.
 - **Review TIMES code in GAMS.** Tom Kober mentioned that the approach will review different models to identify performance issues. The GAMS team need more time to look at performance.
 - **TIMES Extension for Electricity, Gas, Hydrogen and CO2 Transport Infrastructure.** This started with literature review and hiring a PhD student to assess different modelling approaches. It will include non-linear relationships.
 - **Open-source TIMES Excel reader.** No one was present to provide an update.
 - **Third ETSAP book.** The deadline for submitting chapters was the day before the ExCo-meeting (15.November) and the review process will start.
 - **Free VEDA online for students.** Technically it is ready, only need to think about training material. Need some self-learning tools otherwise it would not be very useful. Each academic institution needs to identify a license administrator and Kanors will allocate a license with this email address. Gary Goldstein suggested to add instructions on the ETSAP website.
 - **Summer school.** The success of a recent summer school program was discussed, with positive feedback from participants.
 - **Final Report.** There was a discussion about the completion of the annual report, which had been delayed due to the absence of a foreword. Kathleen noted that the report is ready, even the designed version, and only the Foreword from the Chair is missing. It was proposed that perhaps the co-chairs could also draft the Foreword.

The group discussed the importance of annual reports and the need for contributions from all contracting parties. It was acknowledged that if some countries do not contribute, their input will be missing from the report. To encourage participation, it was suggested to use a standard template for these reports each year. The idea of sending out the report template in advance was raised, with the hope that it would prompt people to think about their contributions earlier.

5.3 Budget and Economy 2023

There are some issues with some incoming membership fee payments (France, Belgium, Greece, Korea, Netherlands). Some members had confirmed they would pay. Most of the fees should be paid by the end of the year. Only Netherlands informed the OA that they will not be able to pay the fee for 2023.

Kari Espegren presented the budget, including an overview of the financial status. The conversation included details about the total income and the current balance after setting aside a reserve of €150,000 for next year's contracts and projects.

Discussions were held about how to allocate the budget, particularly in terms of reserving funds for larger projects or platform migrations, such as moving from GAMS to another language. There was a suggestion to reserve additional funds for significant revisions or improvements. The meeting included a review of the current project proposals, which amounted to around 150K, against an available budget of approximately 200K. There was a consideration of carrying over an additional 100K into the next year. There was also a discussion about whether to set aside a strategic budget for significant projects or use it to increase the project budget for the next year.

An additional 30K will be available for this year's budget after the cancellation of the contract for "Bridging TIMES-Based Scenarios and IAMC Databases (with TNO and CU). This was not yet reflected in the financial overview.

George Giannakidis highlighted the significant decision to move from GAMS to Julia. This was identified as a long-term commitment that would require significant funding and several years to implement. James Foster shared CSIRO's insights on the use of Julia. Ongoing discussions and coordination efforts were discussed, emphasizing that no concrete scoping had been done yet. Gary Goldstein informed the ExCo that he circulated emails to Antti, Olex, Vangelis, and Amit, suggesting a two-step process: firstly, a discussion about the implications of moving to Julia, and secondly, preparing a report for the Executive Committee (ExCo) on the feasibility and timeline of the transition, which is expected to be a 1-2 years activity.

Marcus Blesl emphasized the need to consider potential changes to the TIMES code and VEDA, as well as the associated costs. Tom Kober raised concerns about performance issues and noted that the decision today can only cover a small portion of the budget (there is a limit of 10k for budget allocation), while the project has a much larger scope.

Gary Goldstein explained that GAMS is discontinuing the run-time license for TIMES but will maintain a grandfather clause for existing licensees who continue to pay their annual maintenance. Academic institutions are not affected by the discontinuation of runtime licenses as they use full licenses. However, GAMS has increased their prices for these institutions by 10%. He mentioned the possibility of additional funding for the migration scoping project, estimating a need for 50k to address all questions. He also cautioned that adopting Julia might entail costs, so the decision shouldn't be based solely on cost savings. Tom Kober argued that this issue should have already been part of the project pipeline due to its importance and requested details on what the 50k proposal covers. Marcus Blesl suggested that delaying the decision won't result in a significant loss of time, as the next ExCo meeting is in three months. George Giannakidis summarized the need for a written plan and reassured that funding is available. Gary Goldstein informed the group that two partners are already involved and invited others to join. He concluded that the discussion should continue.

It was proposed to reserve 50K for the study, with an understanding that the ExCo would need to formally approve this allocation after a detailed proposal is submitted. The idea of forming a steering committee to guide the feasibility study was proposed. This committee would include experts and potentially interested ExCo members to provide overview and feedback.

5.4 New project proposals

Teams that submitted proposals provided a brief summary of each proposal.

- **Expand TIMES model files with metadata for improved communication of input data and results.** This project aims to improve the traceability and standardization of data in TIMES models by integrating additional fields and standards into the models' inputs and platforms.
- **Moving the TIMES Documentation to an online and dynamic format.** An online documentation project was discussed, which is not a research contract.
- **Modelling nuclear power in energy system models - assumptions and methodology.**
- **Enabling Agriculture, Forestry, and Other Land Use (AFOLU) Sector Modeling in TIMES.**

After the voting procedure all projects were approved for funding subject to the availability of funds. The new OA will issue the contracts from the 2023 budget.

5.5 Election of new ETSAP Operating agent from 2024

Kathleen Vaillancourt summarized the proposal of setting up a new non-profit organization to act as the OA. The ExCo unanimously approved the proposal for the new operating agent starting from January 2024. Questions were asked about the additional 5000k budget request for the first year in order to cover the initial expenses and Kathleen Vaillancourt clarified that the amount will not be claimed without receipts of expenses up to that amount (lawyer fees, insurance, etc.).

7 OTHER BUSINESS

7.1 93rd ExCo meeting (online): date to be decided by ExCo (spring 2024).

7.2 Other meetings:

ETSAP summer WS and 94th ExCo: 24-25 June 2024, back-to-back with IEW (26-28 June 2024) in Bonn, Germany

ETSAP winter WS 2024: Norway and Canada (pending discussion with local stakeholders) offered to host the winter workshop. It was decided to plan for three days workshops rather than two in order to justify travel expenses.

8. AGREED ACTIONS

Action List from 92 nd ExCo Meeting	Owner
If there is a delay in the meeting documents, the ExCo will be informed by e-mail.	Ongoing - Brian
Support existing ExCo members and engage with interested parties seeking to become Contracting Parties	Ongoing - George/Brian/Kathleen
Seek to coordinate with IEA on joint training workshops for IEA Association Countries	Ongoing - George / Uwe
Extend suspension of Russian Federation from participating in ETSAP TCP activities until there is a change in the circumstances that resulted in the suspension	Ongoing – ExCo
Finalise the process of transferring the O.A. from IFE to ESMIA	Ongoing - Brian/Kari/Kathleen/George
Improved format and process for contracts will be updated by the new O.A. who will issue the contracts in 2024	Kathleen
Rising the visibility of TIMES and organize a marketing strategy	CPs to propose projects for funding related to the increase of visibility of TIMES.
New ETSAP book	Maryse – plan for launch at IEW 2024
Follow up the process of Canada and KAPSARC joining ETSAP since the invitation letters have been sent.	Brian/George
Plan for a training in Vietnam and engage with interested parties to join ETSAP	George/Maurizio
ETSAP members working on industry decarbonization to increase the engagement with IETS TCP. Plan for the common workshops that were proposed in 2024.	Anna/ExCo Members

ANNEX XVI (2023-2025):
ALIGNING ENERGY SECURITY WITH ZERO EMISSIONS ENERGY SYSTEMS



Share the link for the ETSAP-TIAM documentation with all CPs for comments and inputs.	Markus
Follow up on the pending invoices for the fees of 2023	Ongoing - Kari/Linda
Revisit converting TIMES from GAMS to Julia. Submit a detailed proposal for funding for the analysis of the feasibility of the transition process.	Gary and other CPs interested to participate in the process
Continue with ETSAP webinar series – ExCo members to encourage participation and to propose webinar topics to George.	Ongoing – George / Paul / ETSAP CP